Digital communication patterns of the main citizens movements in Malaga (Spain) over 2018-2019

Isabel Ruiz-Mora ⬤ http://orcid.org/0000-0003-0723-9850

Universidad de Málaga, España, isabelruiz@uma.es

María-Jesús Ruiz-Muñoz ⬤ http://orcid.org/0000-0003-1486-0557

Universidad de Málaga, España, mariajesus@uma.es

Alejandro Álvarez-Nobell ⬤ http://orcid.org/0000-0003-1384-3544

Universidad de Málaga, España, aan@uma.es

Abstract: The objective of this work is to delve into the use of digital communication tools by citizens in Malaga to assert their claims. The methodology follows a content analysis of the social networks used by the platforms: Bosque Urbano Málaga, Defendamos Nuestro Horizonte and La Invisible. We analyze the content and activity developed on Facebook, Instagram, YouTube and Twitter (October 2018-March 2019). To conclude, it is necessary to redesign the strategy followed in this context, improving the use of multimedia resources. We point out that citizens have found a new space to promote the debate and to transmit an alternative discourse.

Key words: communication, social media, citizenship, activism, Málaga.

Resumen: Analizamos cómo la ciudadanía emplea las herramientas digitales de comunicación para defender sus reivindicaciones en Málaga. La metodología sigue un análisis de contenido de las redes sociales utilizadas por las plataformas Bosque Urbano Málaga, Defendamos Nuestro Horizonte y La Invisible. Se examina el contenido y la actividad desarrollada en Facebook, Instagram, YouTube y Twitter (octubre 2018-marzo 2019). Concluimos que es necesario rediseñar la estrategia digital y ocupar recursos multimedia. Destacamos que los ciudadanos han encontrado un nuevo espacio para promover el debate y la transmisión de un discurso alternativo al oficial.

Palabras clave: comunicación, redes sociales, ciudadanía, activismo, Málaga.

Introduction

Digital communication phenomenon has reached the private sector in Spain (Pineda Martínez, 2013; Silva, 2014; Paladines *et al.*, 2015; Cuenca-Fontbona *et al.*, 2020) and is beginning to have a strong impact on the public sphere and on the third sector, hand in hand with social movements that seek citizen participation (Álvarez-Nobell and Ruiz-Mora, 2016; Espinar-Ruiz and González-Río, 2015). In this context, the objective of this research[1] is analize different case studies that will allow us to characterize digital communication strategies to achieve citizen participation and its impact on public policies related to urban space. For this purpose, we selected representative examples of the reality in the city of Malaga (Spain), in order to highlight the effort that many platforms and citizen movements are making to gain more attention in the public sphere and take pulse of institutions, thanks to the digital tools and to the awakening of a more active collective conscience committed to its environment and well-being.

With this work we intend to delve into the strategic use that citizens make of digital tools that citizens use to effectively manage their external communication strategy and assert their demands in the city of Malaga. The object of study was defined by selecting the most consolidated citizen movements in Malaga, considering both the time and the support by the citizens and their representation in the local media. Once this definition was made, we set as specific objectives:

- Define communication strategies of each internet movement, establishing similarities and differences between them.
- Determine how these platforms use 2.0 communication tools.
- To deepen in the resources most used by citizen groups to raise awareness and promote citizen participation on the Internet.

Participatory processes have meant a new way of relating to the public and political space that directly affects them. As Pérez-Cubero (2019: 141-142) points out, participation implies "the possibility for citizens to take part, and have a say in the decisions that affect or concern them, and implies being informed, being able to deliberate and choose or propose alternatives". Similarly, the author introduces a nuance when speaking of public participation:

Any interaction between government and civil society includes the process by which government and civil society engage in dialogue, establish partnerships, share information and interact to design, implement and evaluate development policies, projects and programs (Pérez-Cubero, 2019: 142).

It should be pointed out that public participation processes are not always the result of a dialogue initiated by the institution or are truly participatory (Carpentier, 2012). In fact, there are citizen movements demanding more democracy and public participation, which have emerged in the absence of answers (Della Porta and Felicetti, 2019: 2). In line with the latter, Díaz-Aldret (2017: 343) clarifies that participation is a "process through which citizens, who do not hold public office or functions, seek to share to some degree decisions on matters that affect them with government actors and influence them". The activity of participatory social movements seeks to influence public policy decisions (UNDP Project 89477, 2018) and in some ways can come to be considered political processes (Carpentier, 2012: 175).

The Internet and the advent of web 2.0, with its possibilities and limitations (Benkler, 2015; Cammaerts, 2016; Hestres and Hopke, 2017), have provided spaces from which citizenship and social movements take hold to generate debate and promote participation. As Candón-Mena (2011: 363) refers, these movements "use the Net to disseminate their ideas, values and proposals". For his part, Segerberg (2017) highlights the role played by Internet access:

> As more people around the world gain regular access to the Internet, online and social networks are becoming significant contexts in which they come into contact with, or do not come into contact with, news, debates, actions and social contributions related to climate change[2].

Activism and citizen participation

The network bursts into the public sphere (Candón-Mena, 2011) with a globalizing power that makes it possible to agglutinate individual and collective synergies that are committed to actions to raise awareness of specific issues and/or solidarity with proposals promoted by specific groups. This context, marked by the new social spaces of interaction, creates in turn new audiences, new forms of creation of knowledge and opportunities in a technological field as fast as perennial. Social and public actors have transferred

---

2 Text translated by the authors.

their strategies to both the online and offline worlds, and as Luengo (2009) asserts, it is "unimaginable to think of any social or political movement [...] that does not use the Internet as a form of action or organization".

As a reference case in Spain we take the 15-M Movement, in which citizen groups organized themselves using social networks (and action in the streets and squares) to spread their message. Part of their communicative strategy was developed in the social network N-1[3] (Cabello *et al.*, 2013), which was characterized by being free and self-managed. This movement was born out of the protests in Spain on May 15, 2011, calling for a more representative and participatory democracy. Such movement has been deeply studied (Haro and Sampedro, 2011; Toret, 2013; Barranquero and Meda, 2015; Iranzo and Farné, 2015; Tormey and Feenstra, 2015; Barbas and Postill, 2017 and Candón-Mena, 2016 and 2018, among others) and exemplifies what Toret (2013: 109) defines as "the multilayer synchronization of collective behavior", the union of the real (offline) space with the virtual (online) one, through the communication that is established between both spaces of action of citizen groups and where "information, attention and affection are concentrated and channeled thanks to multiple devices and layers of communication, which are intertwined with each other" (Toret, 2013: 109).

For this, group or collective behavior is essential, synchronized as a swarm (Toret, 2013: 107), coordinated in a network, where the members do not always know each other and gather "around a specific objective, they express a type of conflict in the form of a distributed network without central authority, in the form of supra-individual behavior with intelligent sense and self-coordinated in real time" (Toret, 2013: 107).

Thus, we are entering an environment characterized by the empowerment of citizen activism on the network, in the strategy commonly known as cyberactivism and defined by Ugarte (2007: 85) as:

> any strategy that seeks to change the public agenda, the inclusion of a new topic on the agenda of the great social discussion, through the dissemination of a certain message and its propagation through "word of mouth" multiplied by the media and personal electronic publication.

Cueva (2015: 26) calls it "micro political actions". Cyberactivism promotes the union of individual wills, on a temporary basis and that can be prolonged, in the sum of action campaigns; but its strength lies in the fact that through the use of the network "sufficient debate is generated to transcend the virtual world and go out into the street or modify the behavior of a large number of people" (Luengo, 2009).

3 Available at the following link: https://15mpedia.org/wiki/N-1.

It is important to note Cammaerts' (2016) reflection, stating that we have underestimated the role of traditional media in favor of the Internet (or alternative media), and it is necessary to review the relevance given to the network especially in the organization, production and distribution of alternative content: "The Internet is largely dominated by corporate actors and powerful economic interests [...] Moreover, government intervention to shut down subversive content continues to occur"[4] (Cammaerts, 2016: 1). This leads us to reinforce the importance of the multilayer approach carried out by Toret (2013).

At this point we consider it appropriate to make a brief review of the published works. We highlight contributions that serve as references to frame this research, both in the social context of Spain and in the chosen subject matter. In the academic literature we find research such as that of Escalera and Coca (2013: 14), in which a reflection is carried out on "the nature, forms and consequences in which the participation of citizens in Andalusia is manifested".

Regarding the vehicular role of technology between the concepts of citizenship and participation, in his different publications, Olmedo-Salar (2010, 2011 and 2012) makes several contributions on cyberactivism and empowerment through the network. For their part, the works of Haché *et al.* (2012) and Cabello *et al.* (2013) focus on the study of the social web as a citizen platform and its application in the case of Lorea/N1. Linked to the effects of technology, Menéndez's (2012) research should also be highlighted, where the author analyzes "the effects of the Internet and mobile telephony on the vertical vision of politics from the emergence of intelligent crowds connected in cyberspace through virtual communities and social networks" (Menéndez, 2012: 8). Likewise, the work of Adi and Moloney (2012), who examine the Occupy movement protests as a communication tool through public relations and social media, also stands out.

In this context, we include Bennett and Segerberg's (2014) research on the relationship of social movements with media (mass and digital) and how it has evolved into a more active and productive citizen. The authors stress the importance of analyzing each movement individually: how they are organized, their objectives and how they manage the different communication flows.

In his study The Wealth of Networks, Benkler (2015) addresses different dimensions of the Internet; noteworthy is his mention of the pro-commons as an alternative management strategy to state and mercantile schemes, as

---

4 Text translated by the authors.

well as of social production. We also find the contributions of González de la Garza (2015) on the role of social networks as instruments for citizen participation, and those of Cáceres *et al.* (2016), who address participation in public issues as a form of empowerment. Meanwhile, in Rovira's (2017) work, a journey is made through the appropriation of information and communication technology (ICT) through social movements, until reaching the new era of social networks, the idea of "do it yourself" and connected crowds. For their part, Aguilera and Casero-Ripollés (2018) study the contributions of digital media to bring about social change through digital activism; meanwhile, Vizcaíno-Laorga *et al.* (2019) analyze the role of social networks in fostering youth participation in social issues.

Material and Method

Material

The methodology used involved firstly a documentary review of the local press to identify the cases under study. We focused on the three main headers of the city (*Diario Sur, La Opinión de Málaga, Málaga Hoy*) and on the news about citizen participation that were published in the last years (2016-2018). For this purpose, the digital versions of the media were accessed, using the following keywords: platform, citizen, participation, city council. As a result, we identified the three cases that appear most frequently in the period under study:

1. The defense of the social center La Invisible (2007-), which has become a cultural center of citizen management.
2. The platform Bosque Urbano Málaga (2016-), which proposes the creation of a forest in the city itself, subtracting prominence to urban and speculative interests, and that would contribute to mitigate the effects of climate change in Malaga.
3. The platform *Defend Our Horizon* (2016-), which advocates the defense of the bay of Malaga and rejects the rise of a skyscraper in the port of the city.

In the following, we characterize the case studies that are part of the research:

- La Invisible (2007-). It is a social and cultural center of citizen management that was born in March 2007 when a wide network of citizens, neighbors and creators decided to fill with life a beautiful[5] building of municipal property, which was in a state of abandonment (La Invisible, 2020a). The objectives of the movement were:
  - Stimulate processes of "social self-organization".
  - To create a "cultural experimentation laboratory" led by local creators and based on criteria of cooperation, collaborative production and free culture.
  - To promote "training paths" that foster critical thinking, citizen empowerment, social creativity and collective action.
  - Experiment with "citizen management models" that promote equity and the participation of neighbors and citizens in the design, development and management of public policies (La Invisible, 2020a).

Although in January 2011 an agreement was reached with the Malaga City Council, the Junta de Andalucía and the Diputación de Málaga, at present the transfer of the property has not taken place, and the social center has faced several threats of eviction (La Invisible, 2020b). The most important (and serious) was the one that in 2018 motivated the mobilization of the city under the slogan "Malaga is not for sale", managing to paralyze any eviction initiative.

This movement involved the union of some thirty groups, in defense of a city away from the speculative desires of corporations and political groups. On the website of La Invisible you can see the chronology of events and the current situation of relations with the City of Malaga (La Invisible, 2020b).

- *Bosque Urbano Málaga* (2016-). Is a citizen platform with a nonpartisan character, which advocates turning into a real forest area the 177,000 square meters of land that was once occupied by the old drums of Repsol, in the capital of Malaga. The space is located between the districts of Cruz del Humilladero and Carretera de Cádiz, two of the most densely populated areas in Europe. The municipal corporation plans to build four skyscrapers, a shopping mall and several housing blocks (Bosque Urbano Málaga, 2020).

  Constituted as a citizen platform on January 23, 2016, Bosque Urbano Málaga has its origins in the initiative launched on the network

5 It is a bourgeois house of the 19th century, located in the surroundings of the Nasrid wall (14th century) that surrounded the city.

on January 3, 2016 by a couple of neighbors of the city, through the Change.org page, reaching 20,000 signatures in just one month. Since then, the platform has taken multiple steps in its growth and organization. To this end, it has formed three working commissions: Action, Project and Communication (Bosque Urbano Málaga, 2020).

The project has been very well received by the local population, opposition groups, the scientific community (Universidad de Málaga y Universidad de Granada), business and neighborhood associations, professional groups and associations, environmentalists, trade unions... The platform is demanding a public consultation.

Currently, the municipal corporation advocates continuing with its initial plans without taking into account the demands for participation of the citizens' platform and does not consider the alternative option of a forest for the city of Malaga. The municipal proposal is supported by the Partido Popular (PP), which governs the city, and Ciudadanos (Cs). After the BUM platform waited two years for a meeting with the city council, the mayor has offered to reduce the number of housing units, build more offices and increase green areas in the city hall project (Sau, 2020a).

- *Defendamos Nuestro Horizonte* (2016-). It is a citizens' group in defense of the bay of Malaga and that rejects the construction of a skyscraper on the east side of the Port of Malaga, with the intention of housing a hotel. Defendamos a nuestro horizonte collective supports the public use of this space. According to the platform, such a project is not beneficial for Malaga, because a 150-meter high skyscraper, right in the center of the bay, has a great visual impact: it would irreversibly break the coastal facade and the landscape, and would negatively affect the panoramic views, the maritime horizon and the main monumental landmarks (Defendamos Nuestro Horizonte, 2020). This has a very high impact on the environment and implies betting on a very unsustainable city model, in addition to congesting traffic in the area, already saturated by the influx of large cruise ships.

The project involves changing the current regulations, eliminating the current use of public facilities in the area to make a disproportionate luxury hotel accessible to the highest incomes instead of being accessible to all citizens. The awarding process without public bidding, the rapid processing and the distorted administrative control do not offer sufficient guarantees of proper compliance with the law (Defendamos Nuestro Horizonte, 2020).

All this has been done behind the citizens' backs, without their participation or opinion, and contrary to what has been expressed by professionals and experts in urban planning, architects, geographers, economists, etc., and without their participation or opinion... This municipal proposal has the support of PP, Cs and PSOE[6]; and from the platform, a citizen consultation has also been requested. After the Defendamos Nuestro Horizonte collective waited more than two years for a meeting with Mayor Francisco de la Torre, he acknowledged in 2019 the lack of consensus (Sau, 2019), but went ahead with the urban planning project (Sau, 2020b) without listening to the citizens and rejecting many of the allegations submitted by the groups involved in the Urban Planning Management of the city council (*La Opinión de Málaga*, 2019).

Methodology

In a second stage of the research, we applied content analysis to the study of the social networks used by the selected citizen platforms. Based on criteria of relevance, complexity and dissemination potential, Facebook, Instagram, Twitter and YouTube were chosen. This is an analysis of the content shared and the activity generated in the profiles examined; we also identify the strategies used to manage the movement's external communication.

The parameters of the file for the analysis of the shared contents of these platforms have been designed following the recommendations of Iranzo and Farné (2014: 36), to articulate a formal or descriptive axis (in this case, date of publication, sources, typology of language used) and a thematic or significance axis. From a methodological point of view, it was also relevant to consult the works of Rodríguez Herráez *et al.* (2017) and Caerols-Mateo *et al.* (2017) to define the criteria for classifying sources: the citizen platform itself, other citizen platforms, other organizations or institutions; conventional local media; alternative local media, other conventional media, other alternative media, opinion leaders/influencers, citizens and unknown. Regarding the approach to the analysis of the language elements, it has been established taking as a basis the proposal of Caerols-Mateo *et al.* (2017).

Given the importance of delving deeper into the use of language, it was considered to study only publications with multimedia content, those in which written text is combined with other types of elements, in order to be

---

6 The PP is located in the right-wing political spectrum; Cs, in the center-right; and the Partido Socialista Obrero Español (PSOE) in the center-left.

able to unravel more clearly what are the resources most used by the Malaga citizen platforms we are dealing with in social networks[7]. On the other hand, Instagram's specialization in the dissemination of photographic material and YouTube's specialization in the field of video are very attractive from the point of view of language analysis. Moreover, it is precisely this prominence given to audiovisuals that makes them ideal social networks for sharing self-made materials. Thus, in order to delve into the strategies of the different platforms through the development and dissemination of audiovisual content, it is also considered necessary to conduct a more comprehensive analysis of the content published on these two networks from the three citizen platforms under study.

The following variables have been considered: date of publication, sources, type of language used, textual typology (narrative, descriptive, expository, argumentative), register (formal, informal), character (informative, critical, denunciation, didactic, ludic, others), topics addressed, relevant characters and scenarios represented.

The topics have been classified according to the criteria of the agenda of the platforms under study, also including a typification of related contents: own assembly; own demonstration; own informative meeting; own symbolic act; own escrache; own activities program; own signature collection for own cause; own platform meeting with political representatives; crowdfunding, merchandising sales or other self-financing formulas; activities of other platforms or related organizations; other contents closely related to the cause defended by the platform; other contents related to causes defended by related platforms, other contents of citizen interest; others.

In addition, the following types of characters / social actors have been established: members of the platform, members of other platforms or related organizations, local citizenship, general citizenship, local political representatives, other political representatives; representatives of the local cultural field; other representatives of culture; local opinion leaders / influencers; others.

Finally, the space represented was analyzed based on these parameters: scenarios where the platform's direct claiming activities take place; platform headquarters; scenarios where the direct claiming activities of other related platforms take place; scenarios of the political sphere of Malaga; other

---

7 Publications that constitute a mere reiteration of previous content were not considered. Both the content disseminated entirely from the account and the shared publications have been analyzed. In the case of Twitter, direct publications are included, as well as tweets from other profiles included in the user account of each citizen platform.

scenarios of the political sphere; scenarios of the cultural sphere of Malaga; other scenarios of the cultural sphere; other scenarios of Malaga; others.

The sample established for the content analysis comprises the activity carried out by Bosque Urbano Málaga (BUM). Defendamos Nuestro Horizonte (DNH) y La Invisible (LCI) on its Facebook, Instagram, Twitter and YouTube profiles from October 2018 to March 2019, fieldwork periods that have been adjusted to the research plan foreseen in the project where this study is framed.

It should be noted that in the case of Bosque Urbano Málaga, in addition to the official public profile on Facebook, it has another closed profile.[8] For its part, Defendamos Nuestro Horizonte has a Facebook page, where it concentrates the largest number of followers –the one that was analyzed–, and also a public group based on similar content development and dissemination strategies.

On Instagram and Twitter, although this platform has a single profile, in both cases it is called noalrascacielos instead of Defendamos Nuestro Horizonte as on Facebook and YouTube, which poses a difficulty from the point of view of identity construction on social networks and, consequently, also a hindrance for Internet users who search for the platform directly by name.

Meanwhile, La Invisible has two profiles on Instagram: the one analyzed here (lacasainvisible) and invisiblecasa, in which no activity is registered, thus contributing to generate some confusion and false expectations among users of the network.

In addition to content, social media activity was analyzed in order to detect the current state of the digital platforms used by the citizen movements under study, focusing on their productive activity (publications), the results they provoke (followers, likes, retweets), as well as the community reaction (interactions, engagement). For this purpose, we used the Fanpage Karma[9] analysis tool to obtain illustrative data on the practices in the profiles.

In short, the methodological approach designed allows us to unravel the communicative strategies developed by each platform in its social networks through the creation and dissemination of content, also placing special emphasis on the particularities of the audiovisual materials that are shared.

---

8 https://www.facebook.com/profile.php?id=100011257113767.

9 https://www.fanpagekarma.com.

Results

Strategies for the creation and selection of content in social networks of citizen platforms in Malaga

As indicated above, the official profiles of the different platforms in the selected social networks were used for the content analysis. Table 1[10] shows the profiles that have been addressed in these networks and the contents considered in this study.

Regarding the BUM citizen platform on Facebook, it is worth noting that 44.4% of the multimedia content shared are links to articles that come mostly from conventional local media. The use of posters (25%) and photographs and illustrations (18.5%) is also relevant. Most of the content revolves around the cause defended by the platform and the issues related to it (40.7%), although it also devotes considerable space to the activities in which other citizen platforms are involved (25.9%). Twitter is also dominated by publications with links to articles (35.7%), most of which come from local conventional media in which the collective's demands are directly or indirectly addressed. Photographs and illustrations (25%) and posters (14.3%) are also very present in the tweets hosted by the BUM profile.

On Instagram, BUM's activity during the period under analysis was limited to seven posts, of which two were Christmas greetings. The rest of the images (posters, photographs and illustrations) show the main activities carried out by BUM during the months under study. Particularly significant is the strong presence of corporate visual identity elements and also the representation of citizens in three of the images shared (two photographs and one illustration).

The forest land as scenery or the tree that identifies this citizen platform are present in all the images examined. Despite this, no content development strategy focused on this platform is observed, since in all cases these are also images disseminated through Facebook and Twitter. Undoubtedly, BUM's pending subject is YouTube, since this channel only includes one video from 2016 and three from 2017, a year from which the contents have not been updated.

For its part, DNH devotes 77.8% of its Facebook posts to disseminating content in which written text prevails. More than the material coming from the media, it is relevant in this case that 44.2% of these publications are interventions shared from the Twitter account of this citizen platform. It

10 Table 1 can be found in the Annex at the end of this article (Editor's note).

so happens that the period analyzed coincides with the campaign for the presidency of the Junta de Andalucía and therefore, all these tweets are from leaders or political parties that have received a request for positioning by DNH.

However, far from constituting a bias factor, this particularity is precisely symptomatic of the fact that DNH concentrates most of its activity on Twitter. In this network there is a greater and more diversified use of audiovisual resources (photographs, illustrations, videos...), which even offers 31.8% of self-made materials. The creative photomontages in which the skyscraper is simulated next to the Farola del Puerto de Málaga stand out.

As in the case of BUM, the Instagram and YouTube platforms were not leveraged by DNH during the period under analysis. Throughout those three months, only an infographic on the positioning of political candidacies regarding the construction of the skyscraper has been disseminated on Instagram. However, there were periods of greater activity in the preceding stage. The same applies to the management of the YouTube channel.

Among the social networks of the citizen platforms analyzed, we found a greater use of language elements in LCI. The creative strategy relies mainly on the use of posters (62.6%) and photographs and illustrations (14%). LCI, as a unifying force for numerous organizations and groups, is by nature a venue for many outside activities in addition to those it organizes on its own. In this regard, the use of posters to publicize events has proven to be an effective tool, as 53.3% of the publications revolve around LCI's program of activities. It is also the platform that broadcasts the highest volume of self-created content (73.8%), including videos.

 LCI's Twitter profile is also built with audiovisual resources. In this case, we find that posters account for 43.8%, and photographs and illustrations for 17.6% of the material published in the profile. Here, the programming of own activities represents 40.5% of the total volume of content analyzed, and it is also significant that the information offered on activities promoted by other related platforms (21.6%) is greater than on Facebook (12.1%).

On the other hand, unlike BUM and DNH, which primarily echo local mainstream media content, LCI pays more attention to alternative sources. Specifically, 10.2% of the content analyzed on Facebook and 18.3% of the content of the Twitter profile came from non-conventional media.

On Instagram, although LCI has greater activity and regularity, the content focuses on the reiteration of materials that have already been disseminated on the other platforms mentioned, with a clear predominance of posters of its own programming of activities. We found only two

photographs depicting LCI's facilities and three illustrations of our own creation in which the Súper Heroínas, who are the characters that embody the spirit of LCI, are integrated.

They are the standard bearers of the defense of the definitive transfer of the premises currently occupied by the citizens' platform by the City Council of Malaga. They are also in charge of the escraches to the mayor of the city, Francisco de la Torre, as can be seen in the YouTube channel. The only video that LCI has shared on YouTube during the period under review provides a preview of the upcoming Súper Heroínas intervention.

Activity on social networks

Below we present the results obtained after analyzing the profiles of the three citizen platforms. We observe how LCI is the platform with the most fans on Facebook (22 k[11]) and the most posts/day (1.8); it is followed by BUM, with 7.3 k fans and 0.6 posts, and DNH with 755 fans and 0.7 posts. Contrary to expectations, it is the platform defending the Malaga horizon that experiences the highest interaction (4.1%) and the one with the highest community engagement (3%).

On Instagram, LCI's profile has the highest number of followers (4.1k *vs.* 237 for BUM) and follows the highest number of users (119 *vs.* BUM's 60); it is also the most active in terms of posts (1/day *vs.* BUM's 0'5/day), highest community acceptance with 2.1k "likes" (*vs.* BUM's 510).

However, the profile with the highest interaction is that of the BUM, with 17% (compared to 1.8% for LCI) and an engagement of 7.9% (compared to 1.9% for LCI). In the case of DNH, we were able to confirm that the profile has not been active and that at the time of the analysis it had 80 publications and 98 followers, some comments and several "likes". A significant fact is that in the case of DNH, the profile is personal and not institutional, which means that publications can only be "organic" and not advertising.

On Twitter, LCI is once again the initiative with the most tweets published (135) and 4.8 tweets/day, compared to DNH[12] (121 tweets and 4.3/day) and BUM (28 tweets published and an average of 1 tweet/day); but it is BUM that has the highest number of "likes" and retweets (798 and 622, respectively). DNH has 430 "likes" and 417 retweets and LCI, 261 "likes" and 225 retweets. In terms of interaction, DNH's profile generates

---

11 k = miles.

12 In this case, the Defendamos Nuestro Horizonte profile on Twitter is called "No al rascacielos".

the highest number of conversations (12%), followed by BUM (7.1%) and LCI (2.2%). Finally, BUM's profile reflects higher community engagement (2.4%), followed by DNH (1.7%) and La Invisible (0.14%). In terms of number of followers, LCI has the largest number (12.71k), followed by BUM (2.1k) and DNH (1.8k).

When examining the YouTube profile, we found that only LCI and DNH present an active profile. LCI has 197 subscribers, 23k plays and 43 videos; DNH has 41 subscribers, 3.8k plays and 27 videos. BUM has a YouTube profile but no activity since a year before the beginning of this research.

Discussion

The alternative or non-traditional media show an exponential growth and outstanding importance through the Internet. Ubiquitously (in any space, time and person) they are expanding the communication landscape, their evolution and impact is the result of their simplicity, immediacy and speed. Audiences are migrating to an increasingly active role in the production of content and messages transmitted, as they have resources, time and even personal information, unthinkable in other contexts. The power of social participation in digital environments is directly proportional to the techno-social appropriation that citizens make every day.

After studying the main citizen movements in Malaga, we discovered how the axis "defense of public space-citizen organization" characterizes the projects examined. We are facing organized citizen movements against the dismantling of public spaces in favor of real estate speculation. In 2019, we are astonished to witness an economic recovery based on bricks and mortar, also in the public sector, which in 2008 was one of the most serious economic crises Spain had ever faced. Thanks to the network and its tools, citizens find spaces where they can promote debate and the transmission of a discourse outside economic and partisan interests, making them actors in defense of their public space.

After analyzing the activity of the platforms in the digital environment, we can establish that the volume of this activity has a medium-low profile and it is necessary to redesign the strategy followed in this environment. Each network responds to particular criteria and characteristics that must be taken into account when designing and implementing digital communication management strategies. At the same time, it is interesting how the low activity in the profiles analyzed shows their underutilization, considering the

advantages of low cost and high impact that networks offer to civil society organizations.

After this point, it should be noted that in general the LCI profile is the most active in terms of number of publications and the one with the largest number of followers; however, it is not the profile that generates the most reactions, interactions and engagement in the digital community.

Both in the audiovisual content broadcast on the LCI profiles and in those of the other platforms under study, it is paradoxical that the representation of citizens is strikingly low. It also highlights the unidirectional nature of most of the messages analyzed and, consequently, a notable absence of strategies to generate comments, promote the sharing of materials and encourage interaction between social platforms and the rest of the public.

BUM is a profile that remains stable in terms of the parameters examined, although we detected, on an ad hoc basis, that on Instagram and Twitter it generates greater engagement from its community. The analysis allows us to affirm that BUM has a differentiated strategy for the creation and selection of content for Facebook and Twitter, denoting professionalism and optimal use of the potential of each network.

For its part, DNH demonstrates that with a low activity profile it generates high levels of interaction and engagement. YouTube comes in as a secondary platform, and with slightly more acceptance, Instagram. As for Facebook and Twitter, they are the digital tools that attract the most attention and efforts from citizen movements and on which the greatest resources are focused. The narrative strategy does not focus on a scenario as such, but rather on the personification of this emblematic building of the city. However, in the interpellation that is sought to be generated, the representation of the citizens themselves is missing in the imaginary that is built in the messages disseminated in social networks.

Conclusions

Taking up again the objectives of this work, we can conclude that in the movements studied, rather than solid communication strategies and constant communication management, there are dynamics of publication of unidirectional messages that do not favor the development of engagement with citizens. On the other hand, the degree of use of multimedia resources in the networks can also be improved with respect to the creation of their own content, especially in the cases of BUM and DNH.

We observe how communication management is necessary in citizen movements, as organized groups that seek to achieve defined objectives through specific strategies and actions. Therefore, strategic planning becomes crucial for this type of movement or platform. Nor should it be forgotten that a correct use of audiovisual and narrative language will facilitate the transmission and reception of your messages.

Although these results cannot be extrapolated to the Spanish citizens' movement in general, since we are dealing with the analysis of three specific cases contextualized and characterized by the political, economic and social situation of the city at a specific time, they are undoubtedly clear references of the impact that communication is having on the third sector. In methodological terms, the proposal that has been implemented can serve as a basis for future studies at the local level.

On the other hand, the analysis has been carried out by studying specific elements of digital communication (only social networks) and has not included other aspects such as relations with the media or the use of offline vindicative actions (demonstrations, press conferences, talks...), which affect the contents and activity in the digital world; we recall here the multilayer concept of Toret (2013) and its interest for this kind of studies. Undoubtedly, carrying out a complementary study of this type can provide useful results to get an overall view of the communication strategies of these movements and also to determine the degree of professionalism with which communication is managed in these movements, even if it is voluntary and unpaid in most cases.

References

Adi, Ana and Moloney, Kevin (2012), "The importance of scale in Occupy movement protests: a case study of a local Occupy protest as a tool of communication through public relations and social media", in *Revista Internacional de Relaciones Públicas*, vol. 2, no. 4, Spain: Universidad de Málaga.

Aguilera, Miguel de and Casero-Ripollés, Andreu (2018), "¿Tecnologías para la transformación? Los medios sociales ante el cambio político y social", in *Revista ICONO14*, vol. 16, no. 1, Spain: Asociación Científica ICONO 14.

Álvarez-Nobell, Alejandro and Ruiz-Mora, Isabel (2016), "Public information and communication for public participation in Spain", in Oliveira, Evandro; Duarte Melo, Ana y Gonçalves, Gisela [eds.], *Strategic Communication for Non-Profit Organisations Challenges and Alternative Approaches*, Spain: Vernon Press.

Barbas, Ángel and Postill, John (2017), "Communication activism as a school of politics: Lessons from Spain's indignados movement", in *Journal of Communication*, vol. 6, no. 5, United Kingdom: Oxford University Press-ICA.

Barranquero, Alejandro and Meda, Miriam (2015), "Los medios comunitarios y alternativos en el ciclo de protestas ciudadanas desde el 15M", in *Athenea Digital. Revista de Pensamiento e Investigación Social*, vol. 15, no.1*,* Spain: Universidad Autónoma de Barcelona.

Bennett, W. Lance and Segerberg, Alexander (2014), "La comunicación en los movimientos. De los medios de comunicación de masas a las redes sociales", in *Telos: Cuadernos de comunicación e innovación*, vol. 98, Spain: Fundación Telefónica.

Benkler, Yochani (2015), *La riqueza de las redes: cómo la producción social transforma los mercados y la libertad*, Spain: Icaria.

Bosque Urbano Málaga (2020), *Bosque Urbano Málaga*. Available at: http://bosqueurbanomalaga.org [march 8th, 2020].

Cabello, Florencio *et al.* (2013), "The social web beyond 'walled gardens': interoperability, federation and the case of Lorea/N-1", in *PsychNology Journal*, vol. 11, no. 1, Italy: PsychNology Journal.

Cáceres, María Dolores *et al.* (2016), "Hacia la construcción de una ciudadanía digital", in *Prisma Social*, vol. 15, no. 15, Spain: Fundación iS+D para la Investigación Social Avanzada.

Caerols-Mateo, Raquel *et al.* (2017), "Redes sociales y museos: análisis de la campaña en Twitter para el Día Internacional de los Museos y Noche de los Museos", in *Revista Latina de Comunicación Social,* no. 72, Spain: Sociedad Latina de Comunicación Social.

Cammaerts, Bart (2016), "Overcoming net-centricity in the study of alternative and community media", in *Journal of Alternative & Community Media*, vol. 1, no. 1, United Kingdom: Intellect.

Candón-Mena, José (2018), "La aportación de los movimientos sociales y el uso de las TIC en los debates sobre democracia radical y deliberativa", in Pérez-Serrano, María José; Alcolea-Díaz, Gema y Nogales-Bocio, Antonia I. [eds.], *Poder y medios en las sociedades del siglo XXI*, Spain: Egregius.

Candón-Mena, José (2016), "Un medio y un fin: La trascendencia de internet para el movimiento 15M", in Candón Mena, José y Benítez, Lucía. [eds.], *Activismo digital y nuevos modos de ciudadanía: Una mirada global*, Spain: Institut de la Comunicació, Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona.

Candón-Mena, José Ignacio (2011), *Internet en movimiento: nuevos movimientos sociales y nuevos medios en la sociedad de la información*, Spain: Universidad Complutense de Madrid.

Carpentier, Nico (2012), "The concept of participation. If they have access and interact, do they really participate?", in *Fronteiras*, vol. 14, no. 2, Brazil: Universidade do Vale do Rio dos Sinos.

Cuenca-Fontbona, Joan *et al.* (2020), "Transformación digital de los departamentos de relaciones públicas y comunicación de una muestra de empresas españolas", in *Revista de Comunicación*, vol. 19, no. 1, Peru: Universidad de Piura.

Cueva, Javier de la (2015), *Manual del ciberactivista: Teoría y práctica de las acciones micropolíticas,* Argentina: Bandaàparte.

Defendamos Nuestro Horizonte (2020), *No al Rascacielos del Puerto de Málaga*. Available at: https://www.change.org/p/no-al-rascacielos-del-puerto-de-malaga [March 8th, 2020].

Della Porta, Donatella and Felicetti, Andrea (2019), "Innovating Democracy Against Democratic Stress in Europe: Social Movements and Democratic Experiments", in *Representation, Journal of Representative Democracy*, United Kingdom: Routledge.

Díaz-Aldret, Ana (2017), "Participación ciudadana en la gestión y en las políticas públicas", in *Gestión y política pública*, vol. 26, no. 2, Mexico: Centro de Investigación y Docencia Económicas.

Escalera, Javier and Coca, Agustín (2013), *Movimientos sociales, participación y ciudadanía en Andalucía*, Spain: Aconcagua.

Espinar-Ruiz, Eva and González-Río, María José (2015), "Uso de Internet y prácticas políticas de los jóvenes españoles", in *Convergencia Revista de Ciencias Sociales,* vol. 22, no. 69, Mexico: Universidad Autónoma del Estado de México.

González de la Garza, Luis Miguel (2015), *Redes sociales, instrumentos de participación democrática: análisis de las tecnologías implicadas y nuevas tendencias*, Spain: Dykinson.

Haché, Alex *et al.* (2012), "Hacia una web social libre y federada: el caso de Lorea", in *Teknokultura*, vol. 9, no. 1, Spain: Universidad Complutense de Madrid.

Haro, Carmen and Sampedro, Víctor (2011), "Activismo político en Red: del Movimiento por la Vivienda Digna al 15M", in *Teknokultura*, vol. 8, no. 2, Spain: Universidad Complutense de Madrid.

Hestres, Luis and Hopke, Jill (2017), "Internet-Enabled Activism and Climate Change", in *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Climate Science*, United States: Oxford University Press.

Iranzo, Amador and Farné, Alessandra (2015), "Periodismo y movimientos sociales: Participación ciudadana en el Facebook de *El País* y del 15M", in Casero-Ripollés, Andreu [coord.], *Redefiniendo los vínculos entre periodismo y democracia en la era digital: Actas XIX Congreso Internacional Sociedad Española de Periodística*, Spain: Sociedad Española de Periodística, Universitat Jaume I de Castellón

Iranzo, Amador and Farné, Alessandra (2014), "Herramientas de comunicación para el Tercer Sector: El uso de las redes sociales por las ONGD catalanas", in *COMMONS. Revista de Comunicación y Ciudadanía Digital,* vol. 3, no. 2, Spain: Universidad de Cádiz.

La Invisible (2020a), *La Invisible*. Available at: https://www.lainvisible.net/es/lainvisible [March 8th, 2020].

La Invisible (2020b), *Documentos del Proceso de Cesión*. Available at: https://www.lainvisible.net/es/documentos [March 8th, 2020].

La Opinión de Málaga (2019), "Presentan más de 1.000 alegaciones contra el hotel del Puerto", en *La Opinión de Málaga*. Available at: https://www.laopiniondemalaga.es/malaga/2019/04/08/presentan-1000-alegaciones-hotel-puerto/1080583.html [March 8th, 2020].

Luengo, Gemma (2009), "La movilización social en Internet. Eventos organizados a través de la red: ¿fenómeno lúdico o ciberactivismo?", in *Media, cultura i comunicació. Crisis analógica, futuro digital. Actas del IV Congreso Online del Observatorio para la Cibersociedad.* Available at: http://www.cibersociedad.net/congres2009/actes/html/com_la-movilizacion-social-en-internet-eventos-organizados-a-traves-de-la-red-fenomeno-ludico-o-ciberactivismo_515.html [February 25th, 2020].

Menéndez, María Cristina (2012), "Participación ciudadana online y multitudes inteligentes", in *Prisma Social*, no. 8, Spain: Fundación iS+D para la Investigación Social Avanzada.

Olmedo-Salar, Silvia (2010), "Ciudadanos y Medios: Empoderamiento en la Red", in V.V. A.A., *La Universidad y Nuestros Mayores. Aula de Mayores 2009/2010. Sedes de la provincia de Málaga,* Spain: Servicio de Publicaciones de la Universidad de Málaga.

Olmedo-Salar, Silvia (2011), "Ciudadanía, activismo e Internet: reinterpretando la comunicación", in V.V. A.A., *La Universidad y Nuestros Mayores. Aula de Mayores 2010/2011. Sedes de la provincia de Málaga*, Spain: Servicio de Publicaciones de la Universidad de Málaga.

Olmedo-Salar, Silvia (2012), "La e-globalización de la comunicación: Redes sociales y ciberactivismo. Apuestas para la acción social", in V.V.AA., *La Universidad y Nuestros Mayores. Aula de Mayores 2011/2012. Sedes de la provincia de Málaga*, Spain: Servicio de Publicaciones de la Universidad de Málaga.

Paladines, Fanny *et al.* (2015), *Comunicación estratégica en las organizaciones*, Spain: Cuadernos Artesanos de Comunicación.

Pérez-Cubero, María Eugenia (2019), "La participación ciudadana de los movimientos socioambientales en América Latina", in *Revista Colombiana de Sociología,* vol. 42, no. 1, Colombia: Universidad Nacional de Colombia.

Pineda Martínez, Paula (2013), "Relaciones Públicas Online de excelencia: Las empresas energéticas del IBEX 35 ante el reto de comunicar su conducta responsable en un contexto abierto e interactivo", in *Revista Internacional de Relaciones Públicas*, vol. 3, no. 5, Spain: Universidad de Málaga.

Proyecto PNUD 89477 (2018), ¿Qué entendemos por participación ciudadana? Available at: http://proyectopnud89477.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/07/Que%CC%81-entendemos-por-participacio%CC%81n-ciudadana.pdf [March 25th, 2020].

Rovira, Guiomar (2017), *Activismo en red y multitudes conectadas. Comunicación y acción en la era de Internet,* Spain: Icaria.

Rodríguez Herráez, Beatriz *et al.* (2017), "Clasificación de información en redes sociales. Análisis de contenido en Twitter de empresas de comercio electrónico", in *Revista Espacios*, vol. 38, no. 52, Venezuela: Universidad Central de Venezuela.

Sau, José Antonio (2019), "El alcalde admite que no hay consenso ciudadano sobre la Torre del Puerto", in *La Opinión de Málaga*. Available at: https://www.laopiniondemalaga.es/malaga/2019/01/10/alcalde-admite-hay-consenso-ciudadano/1059553.html [March 8th, 2020].

Sau, José Antonio (2020a), "El parque de Repsol costará 8,3 millones de euros y tendrá 80.000 metros cuadrados", in *La Opinión de Málaga*. Available at: https://www.laopiniondemalaga.es/malaga/2020/01/08/parque-repsol-costara-8-millones/1137309.html [March 8th, 2020].

Sau, José Antonio (2020b), "El proyecto de la Torre del Puerto avanza al superar otro paso administrativo", in *La Opinión de Málaga*. Available at: https://www.laopiniondemalaga.es/malaga/2020/03/06/proyecto-torre-puerto-zanja-paso/1150989.html [March 8th, 2020].

Segerberg, Alexandra (2017), "Online and Social Media Campaigns For Climate Change Engagement", in *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Climate Science,* United States: Oxford University Press.

Silva, Leonardo (2014), "Estudio sobre las relaciones de los productores de contenidos audiovisuales con su público: Youtube Brasil", in *Revista Internacional de Relaciones Públicas,* vol. 4, no. 7, Spain: Instituto de Investigación en Relaciones Públicas, Universidad de Málaga.

Toret, Javier [coord.] (2013), *Tecnopolítica y 15M: la potencia de las multitudes conectadas: un estudio sobre la gestación y explosión del 15M*, Spain: Universitat Oberta de Catalunya/ Internet Interdisciplinary Institute.

Tormey, Simon and Feenstra, Ramón A. (2015), "Reinventing the political party in Spain: the case of 15M and the Spanish mobilisations", in *Policy Studies*, vol. 36, no. 6. Australia: Routledge.

Ugarte, David de (2007), *El poder de las redes. Manual ilustrado para personas, colectivos y empresas abocados al ciberactivismo*, Spain: Marcial Pons.

Vizcaíno-Laorga, Ricardo *et al*. (2019), "Participación y compromiso de los jóvenes en el entorno digital. Usos de las redes sociales y percepción de sus consecuencias", in *Revista Latina de Comunicación Social,* vol. 74, no. 4, Spain: Universidad de La Laguna.

Annex

Table 1

Content published on social networks by citizen platforms in Malaga (October-December 2018)

Citizen Platform	Social Network	Content published	Content analyzed
Bosque Urbano Málaga (BUM)	Facebook https://www.facebook.com/ BosqueUrbanoMalaga @BosqueUrbanoMalaga	30	2
	Instagram https://www.instagram.com/ bosqueurbanomalaga bosqueurbanomalaga	7	7
	Twitter https://twitter.com/BosqueUrbanoMA @BosqueUrbanoMA	30	28
	Youtube https://www.youtube.com/channel/ UCQKLSr44KsUGXdsH9diLlSw Bosque Urbano Malaga	0	0

Defendamos Nuestro Horizonte (DNH)	Facebook https://www.facebook.com/ defendamosnuestrohorizonte @defendamosnuestrohorizonte	19	19
	Instagram https://www.instagram.com/ noalrascacielos noalrascacielos	1	1
	Twitter https://twitter.com/noalrascacielos @noalrascacielos	162	91
	Youtube https://www.youtube.com/channel/ UCe2x2FKnRjvQPA3r28llggg Defendamos Nuestro Horizonte - No al Rascacielos	0	0
La Invisible (LCI)	Facebook www.facebook.com/LaCasaInvisible @LaCasaInvisible	123	107
	Instagram www.instagram.com/lacasainvisible lacasainvisible	30	30
	Twitter https://twitter.com/LaCasaInvisible @LaCasaInvisible	276	153
	Youtube www.youtube.com/user/LaInvisibleTV/ videos La Invisible Comunicación	1	1
	Total	679	439

Source: Own elaboration based on data from citizen platform profiles on Facebook, Instagram, Twitter and YouTube.

Isabel Ruiz-Mora. Associate Professor, University of Malaga, Department of Audiovisual Communication and Advertising, Spain. Line of research: corporate social responsibility and the role of audiences in creating spaces for dialogue. Recent publications: Pineda-Martínez, Paula and Ruiz-Mora, Isabel (2019), "Comunicación interna y narrativas transmedia, nuevas estrategias para la empresa responsable. Estudio de caso de Telefónica", en *El Profesional de la Información*, vol. 28, no. 5, Spain: El Profesional de la Información; Ruiz-Mora, Isabel and González, Ana Elizabeth (2019), "Communication strategies that support grassroots movements against anti-environmental policies: Student participation in the creation of Bosque Urbano for Málaga", in Ruiz-Mora, Isabel; Gonçalves, Gisela; Somerville, Ian [orgs.], *Organizational and Strategic Communication Research: Global Trends*, Portugal: LabCom Books; Ruiz-Mora, Isabel and Guerrero-Navarro, Daniel (2018), "Responsabilidad Social en el fútbol profesional español ¿Una relación para el desarrollo de un nuevo rol ciudadano?", in *Revista Retos*, vol. 8, no. 16, Ecuador: Universidad Politécnica Salesiana.

María-Jesús Ruiz-Muñoz. Professor, University of Málaga, Department of Audiovisual Communication and Advertising, Spain. Line of research: the representation of identities in audiovisual media. Recent publications: Ruiz-Muñoz, María-Jesús and Pérez-Rufí, José-Patricio (2020), "Hermanas, amigas y compañeras en serie. La ficción coral femenina española de las televisiones generalistas y plataformas VOD (1990-2019)", in *Estudios sobre el mensaje periodístico,* vol. 26, no. 2, Spain: Universidad Complutense de Madrid; Ruiz-Muñoz, María-Jesús (2019), "El desarrollo de competencias sobre escritura para medios audiovisuales en el contexto de la enseñanza de Grado", in Felipe, Andrea [coord.], *Analizando el fenómeno docente del futuro,* Spain: Pirámide; Caminos, Alfredo and Ruiz Muñoz, María Jesús (2018), "A evolução do roteiro: do audiovisual ao transroteiro. Modalidades e práticas de escrita", in Massarolo, João *et al.* [orgs.], *Desafíos da Transmídia: processos e poéticas*, Brazil: Estação das Letras e Cores.

Alejandro Álvarez-Nobell. Assistant Professor, University of Málaga, Department of Audiovisual Communication and Advertising, Spain. Line of research: innovation and planning in strategic communication. Recent publications: Moreno, Ángeles; Molleda, Juan Carlos; Álvarez-Nobell, Alejandro; Herrera, Marco, Athaydes, Andreia; Suárez, Ana María (2019), *Comunicación estratégica y sus retos: fake news, confianza, información para la toma de decisiones, liderazgo y compromiso laboral. Resultados de una encuesta*

en 19 países, Brussels and Madrid: EUPRERA/Dircom; Moreno, Ángeles; Molleda, Juan Carlos; Athaydes, Andreia; Suárez, Ana María; Herrera, Marco; Álvarez, Alejandro (2017), *Latin American Communication Monitor 2016-2017. Tendencias en comunicación estratégica: big data, automatización, engagement, influencers, coaching y competencias. Resultados de una encuesta en 17 países*, Spain: EUPRERA y DIRCOM; Castillo-Esparcia, Antonio; Álvarez-Nobell, Alejandro (2014), *Evaluación en comunicación estratégica*, Spain: McGraw Hill.