

Pedagogies for reconciliation: artistic practices for peacemaking in Colombia

Josefina Echavarría-Álvarez  <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5637-5942>

Universidad de Innsbruck, Austria y Universidad de Notre Dame, Estados Unidos

josefina.echavarría@uibk.ac.at

Abstract: In the face of the challenges to the implementation of the Final Agreement between the Colombian government and the guerrillas FARC-EP, artistic practices give life to peacebuilding and reconciliation, constituting key elements for the pedagogies for reconciliation. It starts with a literature review on peace research proposals that highlight the Philosophy for Peace and the capacities of individuals and communities to reconcile in plural and diverse ways. Afterwards, the article discusses the institutional architecture of the Transitional Justice System, with emphasis on the Truth Commission. Finally, the text shows three qualitative research examples of auto-ethnography, semi-structured interview and focus groups about the photography exhibition *The Witness (El Testigo)* by Jesús Abad Colorado, the documentary films of Daniela Abad Lombana and the Association More Art More Peace (*Más Arte Más Paz*). The research results serve to draw key findings regarding the pedagogies for reconciliation in the Colombian post- accord context.

Key words: Colombia, post-agreement, reconciliation, philosophy for peace, arts, pedagogy, conflict transformation.

Resumen: En medio de los retos para implementar el Acuerdo Final entre el gobierno colombiano y la guerrilla de las FARC-EP, prácticas artísticas dan vida a la construcción de paz y reconciliación, conformando elementos clave de las pedagogías para la reconciliación. El texto comienza con una revisión de la literatura de la Investigación para la Paz resaltando la Filosofía para hacer las Paces y las capacidades de individuos y comunidades para reconciliarse. Luego se discute la arquitectura del Sistema de Justicia Transicional, con énfasis en la Comisión para la Verdad. Finalmente, el texto presenta tres ejemplos cualitativos de investigación autoetnográfica, entrevista semiestructurada y grupos de enfoque sobre la exposición de fotografía *El Testigo* de Jesús Abad Colorado, los documentales de Daniela Abad Lombana y la Asociación Más Arte Más Paz. Los resultados de investigación ponen de manifiesto claves para las pedagogías de reconciliación para hacer las paces en el post-acuerdo colombiano.

Palabras clave: Colombia, post-acuerdo, reconciliación, Filosofía para Hacer las Paces, artes, pedagogía, transformación de conflictos.

Original article
language: spanish.
Translated by Luis
Cejudo Espinosa

Recepción: 05/07/19

Aprobación: 29/10/19



Introduction¹

In November 2016, the Colombian Congress approved the *Acuerdo Final para la Terminación del Conflicto y la Construcción de una Paz Estable y Duradera* [Final Agreement for the Conclusion of the Conflict and Building a Stable Long-lasting Peace] (Acuerdo Final, 2016) between the government and Fuerzas Armadas Revolucionarias de Colombia-Ejército del Pueblo (FARC-EP), which intended to close a horrifying war of more than five decades, eight million of victims and close to 220 000 murders (CNMH, 2013). Despite the Final Agreement was supported by the community, considered one of the most comprehensive in the world, and with high social participation, especially the victims (Bouvier, 2014; Peace Insight, 2017), the setting up of the Agreement has been fraught with numberless obstacles (Kroc, 2018).² Among these, political, from the election in 2008 of president Iván Duque, critic of the Agreements to the modification of laws that ensured the participation of the victims in the Congress under a special circumscription (Echavarría *et al.*, 2019).

In like manner, hundreds of social leaders and activists have been murdered in the last two years, while investigations do not seem to advance nor offer actual and full information on the authors and responsibilities for the crimes (Defensoría del Pueblo, 2019). The effect on the community leaders has been devastating, both for those directly harmed by violence and those who see in their profession and vocation a threat for their own lives (Fundación Pares, 2018).

However, there is a series of key documents and processes that are a counterweight for the destructive dynamics with reconciliation proposals and peace construction. Significantly, the integral system of truth, justice, redress

1 This work frames into the research line on “Education for Peace in Societies in Transition” developed in the Center for Peace and Conflict in the University of Innsbruck (Austria), of which the author is co-director. The fieldwork was supported by the University of Innsbruck (Austria), Research Group on Latin America of the University of Vienna (Austria) and the Center of Studies for Reconciliation of the University of Jena (Germany). The final edition of the text was carried out during a research stay in Kroc Institute in the University of Notre Dame. My sincere thanks to all the institutions above that support peace research.

2 Even before being set into motion, the Agreement already had numberless movements against it, which became tangible in “Plebiscite for Peace”, held on October 2nd, of the same year, when the “No” expressed by the majority of the population triumphed against the Agreements. Despite the modifications made following the spokespersons of the “No”, polarization and discontentment have not ceased (Gómez-Suárez, 2017).

and no-repetition (SIVJNR) started to be set up with the Commission on Ascertaining the Truth (CEV), Special Jurisdiction for Peace (JEP) and the Special Unit for the Search of People Considered Missing (UBPD).

The combination of these various forms of justice, truth and reconciliation importantly encourages territorial peace construction. This peace, which is dealt with in the Agreements, is not a single one, but many peaces, anchored to the territories where they are born, to the people involved in the processes with their gender, languages and ethnicity characteristics as well as other features of the inhabitants of the biodiverse Colombian geography (Cairo *et al.*, 2018). Then, we speak of senti-thinking peaces (Escobar, 2014), peaces that are rationally understood but which are lived and felt emotionally and corporally, which intend to re-create the territory as a space for life “materially and symbolically appropriated [so that] it fulfills, once again or finally, the collective functions it has list owing to the armed conflict” (Peña, 2019).

In this crossing over obstacles and opportunities for the construction of many peaces, art expressions that account for the memories of war and longing for peace and reconciliation of many Colombians in the country and abroad with metaphoric languages has been developed. Renowned and professional photojournalists such as Jesús Abad Colorado, young documentalists such as Daniela Abad Lombana, and new artistic communities of reincorporated people such as *Más Arte, Más Paz*, enjoy wide acceptance and become more capable to mobilize and gather.

They also display elicitive ways of conflict transformation that give life to peaces, territorial, we call “elicitive” forms (Lederach, 1995; Dietrich, 2013; Martínez Guzmán, 2005), as long as these artistic methods evoke strategies to transform conflict relations between old adversaries from their local knowledge and with a clear cultural anchoring. From an elicit standpoint, it may be understood that the Final Agreement has provided an institutional framework for reconciliation, but the affected communities are the ones that define the direction, methods and the very pace of their changes at personal, relational cultural and institutional levels (Paffenholz, 2015; Hancock and Mitchell, 2007).

The present article is an original contribution toward the comprehension of the ways in which reconciliation may settle down, root and flower in post-agreement contexts. Distancing from prescriptive formulas that may be transferred as a method easily replicable in one context or another, this work outlines elicit routes after two main goals. The first one is to show how Peace Research (PR) envisages the central importance of the ethical and aesthetical

practices of reconciliation. To do so, the text summarizes fundamental PR ideas on reconciliation and then makes it visible three artistic practices carried out in the territories and are not being documented in the official annals of the history of transactional justice.

A second goal is to contribute to the PR literature on “pedagogies” for reconciliation. Echoing the pedagogies for peace (Gómez-Suárez, 2017; Paris-Albert, 2017), pedagogies for reconciliation include work on attitudes and values to strengthen the capabilities for pacific coexistence (CEV, 2019b). Additionally, these pedagogies follow formal and informal strategies in which arts are used in function of education for peace and inform the citizenry on the post-agreement institutional structures. However, it not only about transmitting contents (for instance, on the legal or constitutional dispositions of the Final Agreement), but pedagogies involve people holistically and effectively. Pedagogies for reconciliation entail empathy, that is to say, broaden and improve the capacity to be in the other’s footsteps, self-reflection on the passive or active role taken in the war and in peace building. It is worth mentioning that pedagogies are also methods for empowering and overtaking reconciliation.

In the following pages, the keys for the new stakes on reconciliation are distilled from two fundamental questions that obey the curiosity and commitment of PR to be relevant, useful and based on an ethics that embraces the world, nature and human beings in their entire complexity.

The first question is, how can reconciliation process nourish PR theories in order not to forget the call to make research “in the service of humankind” (Martínez Guzmán, 2001). This way, one of the purposes that guide this work is encompassed and it is to pay homage to Vicent Martínez Guzmán, as in virtue of his ideas related to the plurality of Philosophy for Peace Making (Martínez Guzmán, 2001) and the human capabilities to realize them (Martínez Guzmán, 2005), in PR it becomes possible to identify, recognize and value artistic expressions in reconciliation practices as a central input of the research and work to build many peaces.

The second question is, what kind of reconciliations are being forged in Colombia from arts? This research line is still incipient and this text intends to begin to gather the advancements which on the terrain the affected communities and people by the conflict are effectively using to reconcile.

The first section of the article will refer to the importance and characteristics of the processes for reconciliation from PR inspired by the Philosophy for Peacemaking (Martínez Guzmán, 2001), reconciliation anchored in the realities of people involved in conflicts moves toward the

center of research attention. Secondly, there is a brief presentation of the complex post-agreement scenario in Colombia and how reconciliation has been depicted in the institutional architecture of the Peace Agreements, specifically in SIVJNR. In the third section particular examples of artistic expression and the voices of the partakers are discussed by means of observation and auto-ethnography, interview and focus group, as a result of the fieldwork carried out in Colombia in February and March 2019. Finally, the article puts forward keys for a pedagogy for reconciliation, that is to say, educational and artistic processes with high social content that draw us nearer to the many possibilities and realities we have for “peacemaking”.

We can make reconciliations

With the title *Podemos Hacer las Paces* [We can make peace] Vicent Martínez Guzmán (2005) managed to summarize one of the most relevant PR messages, especially in post-agreement contexts: “if we, human beings, want, we are able to make pace, we can organize pacifically our coexistence” (Martínez Guzmán, 2005: 15). Due to the quality of the thesis and its relevance for the Colombian case, in this first section, the basic ideas of Philosophy for Peacemaking (Martínez Guzmán, 2001; 2005), which indicate key elements of reconciliation in Colombia from artistic practices and allow commencing the construction of a path for pedagogy for reconciliation.

Vicent Martínez Guzmán (1949-2018) was a Valencian peace researcher, who understood himself mainly as a functionary in service of humankind (Forastelli, 2015: 25) and advocated for mutual accountability regarding how we coinfigure or perform our relationships. His main argument was supported on the fact we can become aware of our fragility and open to the difference and diversity to enrich the plurality of ways of being humans” (Martínez Guzmán, 2005: 19).

As a holder of UNESCO Chair of Philosophy for Peace, he had at Universitat Jaume I de Castellón from 1999 to his death in 2018, Martínez Guzmán conceptually and pedagogically developed his insistence on seeing, appreciating and recognizing capabilities for peacemaking. In his writings and works as a professor, researcher and mentor, he insisted that the recognition of capabilities and competences for peacemaking should start from a necessary “epistemological turn”, understood as a “change in what we say when we say we know what we can make peace” (Martínez Guzmán, 2005: 21).

Martínez Guzmán (2005: 29) claimed that this turn required to recover the semantic meaning of philosophy, as that “craving and passionate interest to find out about the nature of other human beings”. Little by little, he took his readers along his reflections to find the connecting lines between peace and reconciliation.

[...] for pacemaking we need to be educated in a sort of love for the others and for ourselves, the other parts of ourselves; attentive to the clamor of those who suffer as an expression of mercy; breaking the spiral of violence with love for the enemies, not responding an evil with another, but being diligent in our relations, treating one another with care (Martínez Guzmán, 2005: 32-33).

For Martínez Guzmán, relating from love, humility, tenderness, care and generosity would require a holistic conception of human being and peace and conflicts (Comins, 2015). On one side, he argued that there was no dichotomy between feelings and reason, as neither is there between “rational systematic exposures and tales deemed mythical” (Martínez Guzmán, 2005: 33), since human being has the capability to grasp themselves and the rest in their own paradoxes, with no need to solve them, with acceptance and care and “deep, diligent, careful curiosity” (Martínez Guzmán, 2005: 33).³

In this context, the practice of care appears as an autopoietic act, that is to say, the transformation of ourselves and the others, since “the person who care transforms, re-signifies and remakes through the practice of care” (Comins, 2015: 41). Then caring is always associated to values essential in peace culture such as empathy and tenderness, but also to fundamental activities to build Culture for Peace (Comins, 2015: 42).

Especially in the moments after violence and atrocities, Martínez Guzmán considered there is need to reinterpret violent episodes beyond the explanations of the “warlords”, who see in violence the reconfirmation of their theses on a greater need for security.⁴ On the contrary, the philosopher invited peace researchers deem the episodes of violence symptoms of the

3 For Wolfgang Dietrich (2012), dear friend of Vicent Martínez Guzmán, the non-rational characteristics of human beings, and therefore of their conflicts make it essential to think that the transformation has to be trans-rational as well, that is to say, involving rationality, but going beyond it, for peace also involves emotional, spiritual and bodily elements.

4 For Vicent Martínez Guzmán (2005: 55), the claim for “security” should be studied in their etymological roots to understand the trap it encompasses. Security means *Sine-cura*, i.e., with no concern, without a care, with fear for failure, to be fragile and human. Because of this, according to the author, there is need to destroy the myth of security and embrace the insecurity of many peaces. In the Colombian case, this grammar of violence and in/security may be studied in Echavarría (2010).

need to accept human vulnerability and fragility, of others and oneself, as a pressing need to build not only many, but imperfect peaces.

Here, we bring to mind the meaning that Francisco Muñoz (2006: 409) gave the term “imperfect peace”, since peaces are unfinished, processual, and are stealthily in all the spaces where conflicts are regulated in a pacific manner.

These differences between violence and conflict are highly important, since their differentiation allows comprehending the productive potential of pacific transformation as well as the need for reconciliation after violence (Jiménez Robles, 2016) and even, over the course of events and violent occurrences. Vicent Martínez Guzmán (2005) affirmed that violence begins by breaking the intrinsic and communicative solidarity of human relationships:

Violence is also the listener's neglect, lack of care before the speaker, disregard what is spoken, breaking the relation established by the illocutionary effect of comprehension. [...] *Violence starts with the lack of recognition of one another as beings competent for communication.* Solidarity is not created but is reconstructed when we rebuild what we can ask one another, when we rebuild the normativity of how we might do things one another (Martínez Guzmán, 2005: 73).

Because of this reconciliation is not a “phase” after the war, but it may be understood even as a transformation method over ongoing violent conflicts. This processual standpoint of reconciliation, state Leiner and Flämig (2012: 16), has managed to poetically condense it, German Friedrich Hölderlin (1770-1843), who wrote at the end of his novel *Hyperion* that reconciliation develops in the middle of disputes so that everything that was separated reconcile again.⁵ That is to say, the ceasefire, signing of agreements or treaties are excellent moments to start reconciliation processes, however, reconciliation is a performative making with no preconditions, as it may face violence, challenge it and effectively serve as a method for its transformation.

Peace agreements promote important platforms, but are not automatically equivalent to peace re-construction. When there is a ceasefire, overcoming the mutual conception of the conflicting parties as adversaries and creating institutions to support deep cultural and structural changes are parts of the transformation of conflicts, which do not end with a war, for they are part of the human shuffle. Martínez Guzmán (2005: 125) proposes that conflict “also transforms the perceptions of the self, of the others, and of the topics in question”. This way, it becomes quite difficult to understand the intentions of

5 “Versöhnung ist mitten im Streit und alles Getrennte findet sich wieder” (Hölderlin, quotes directly from German in Leiner and Flämig, 2012: 16).

others and the capacity to articulate the proper intentions is lost. In situations of long-term conflicts, such as the Colombian, the images of the enemies may even become institutionalized (Martínez Guzmán, 2005: 125-126).

Finally, PR postulates that transformation of conflicts must propose alternatives, not only describe the dialectic (Martínez Guzmán, 2005: 126; Martínez *et al.*, 2009). In this regard, Lederach's (1995) writings on the elicited models for transformation are very enlightening. The elicited transformation of conflicts alludes to the capability to "evoke" the parts in conflict have to recover communication and be able to face the causes that drive destructive dynamics, and advance in transformation processes that help them make their relationships more functional.

This elicited vision of transformation has allowed other peace researchers such as Wolfgang Dietrich (2012, 2013 and 2017) to create specific methods and instruments for facilitators and workers of peace. A whole philosophical, methodological and practical scaffolding has been created by Dietrich with a view to guiding the parties in conflict in their own conflicting realities and to recognizing new courses of action that enable them to overcome violence and transform the destructive patterns in the epicenter of conflicts.

In this sense, human relations, which connect one another, slowly appear in the center of attention of PR and the elicited transformation of conflicts. If over long periods of violence and destructive management of conflicts, human relationships have withered, have broken, while people seem separated, reconciliation invites them to remember they share human connections with everyone, even with their past enemies and adversaries. From the philosophical and anthropological standpoint of PR, there is talk of "remembering", since the basis is, as noted by Martínez Guzmán (2001 and 2005) and Francisco Muñoz (2006), that human beings are joined by intrinsic solidarity, inherent to humanity, which is cracked with violence.

The canvas of pedagogy for reconciliation is thus painted with relating in the center of attention. On the basis of John Paul Lederach's (2016: 247-250) moral imagination, metaphoric language is resorted to, for reconciliation demands a creative act, since it engages in changing, innovating, disarranging violent relationships and looking for new approximation angles to the others and new forms of communication forgotten or unlearned over violent times.

Aesthetics helps those who try to change from cycles of violence to new relationships, and those of us who want to support such movements to see ourselves as we really are, artists who light and keep alive something that has not existed but up to that moment. [...] Attention has to be paid to the image. Listen closely to the central. Trust in intuition and follow it. observe the metaphors. Avoid confusion and excess of activity (Lederach, 2016: 150-151).

Some years later, and accompanied by his daughter Angela Lederach, John Paul Lederach (Lederach and Lederach, 2014) deepens into the importance of the arts, not only to express “the unspeakable”, but also to capture, though imperfectly, the great capabilities people have to recompose, cure and heal. For the authors, arts are part of the reconciliation processes from two fundamental qualities: space and movement. In this regard, they explain that despite the very wide variety of definitions for reconciliation,⁶ many studies share two points of the consensus. The first is:

The idea that reconciliation comes from and solidifies around a group of relationships [...] guided by a spatial metaphor of the encounter, an interpretation that proposes places for people with enmities to gather, interchange, commit and even hug one another; where they create and recreate common territory in the contradicting histories incusted into their social and physical geographies.

Another point of consensus is the widely assumed notion that the best way to understand reconciliation is as a process that entails some form of movement [...] (Lederach and Lederach, 2014: 30).

The movements the authors refer to bring to mind two important paces observed in the practices of reconciliation after prolonged and violent conflicts: circular movements, where the change requires repetition, a long-lasting resonance container, and movements that seem to penetrate the intensity of relationships that heal, challenging linear logical frameworks and inviting to understand the metaphors of social change that “clarify the lived experiences [of the local communities] and the intervention” (Lederach and Lederach, 2014: 238).

By and large, these qualities are not found in documents and legal texts nor in descriptions of institutional projects, but in the setting into motion of artistic expressions such as music, songs as well as in writing poetry. Even though many of these artistic expressions are auditive and sometimes invisible, are intensely palpable and felt by the participant communities. Hence the importance that PR becomes aware of “the containers, circularity, ceremonies, rituals, artistic processes, music and poetry, to name a few elements, provide a central component, not peripheral, of the process of change” (Lederach and Lederach, 2014: 239).

⁶ There is a rather extensive series of reconciliation dimensions (Rettberg and Ugarriza, 2016; Lederach and Lederach, 2014) that in line of PR here exposed may be identified as intellectual, affective, corporal and spiritual of the very interdependent relationships that intend to re-connect (Martínez Guzmán, 2005), even amidst disputes (Leiner and Flämig, 2012) that relates human beings intentionally for the first time with certain individual and groups (Du Toit, 2018).

To contribute to elicit this change, PR resorts to education sciences, and in this particular case, of education to make many peaces and many reconciliations in post-agreement contexts. In this sense, it is essential to go beyond modern education or a banking pedagogy in Freire's sense (cited in Paris-Albert, 2017: 67) and venture toward liberating and creative pedagogies (Paris-Albert, 2017). Liberating Pedagogies promote reflection on topics such as "non-violence, gender equality, citizen responsibility, the positive regulation of conflicts" (Paris-Albert, 2017: 73), reintegrate arts as a fundamental part of citizen education (Enslin and Ramírez-Hurtado, 2013) and teach on the difficulties and satisfactions posed by processes of peace and reconciliation (Hernández, 2018).

Due to the integrality inherent to the very experiences of peace, creative pedagogies also incorporate affective didactics and contents. Learning through the heart in an empathic and affective manner, starts from the premise that the basic human condition is connection (Koppensteiner, 2018: 69). Although pedagogies for reconciliation may be included as a part of a relational curriculum and radically empathic (Murphy, 2018), education for peace has also significantly contributed to learning in informal spaces. Since they are topics such as transformation, pedagogies for reconciliation need to link to a broad range of daily spaces and widen the matrix of aesthetic and ethical practices that provide opportunities for all to (learn to) reconcile (Cremin and Archer, 2018).

Philosophic reflections and pedagogies inspired by the writings of Martínez Guzmán and other mentioned peace researchers, at present, seem more current and relevant than ever, when it is intended to understand how communities by the Colombian armed conflict look for reconciliation by means of artistic practices after the signing of the Final Agreement.

Reconciliation in the architecture of the Final Agreement

Trying to understand the stakes on reconciliation from the text of the Final Agreement requires to commence with an elemental clarification: the text is produced in a context, with pretexts and imbued into intertextual relations. Due to space constraints, it is not possible to deeply explain each of the faces, but it is worth mentioning their most important aspects to decipher how reconciliation is thought in the very text's architecture.

As regards the context, i.e., with the discourses that surrounded the drafting of the text of the Final Agreement, one of the most significant topics was the post-truth political environment that polarized the Colombian

society. The post-truth context was characterized by the use of (social) media as a strategy to deceive the voters by circulating simplistic and highly emotional political histories, which made it very difficult to differentiate correct from incorrect information, truthful and false, honest and dishonest as regards negotiations, the Plebiscite for peace in October 2016 and then the text of the Agreement itself. The policy of post-truth filled citizens with fear and hatred and, ironically, resorted to this political strategy to trivialize politics itself (Gómez-Suárez, 2017: 463).

Relative to pre-texts of the Final Agreement, that is to say, the previous discourses that enable the creation of the text, we find the pendulum between many wars and many peaces in Colombia's history (Echavarría, 2010). Previous negotiations with guerrillas, especially the failed dialogues of El Caguán (1999-2002) with the very FARC-EP, under president Andrés Pastrana, were greatly relevant for, on one side, the negotiating team to agree on clear communication rules and to keep up with the agenda from the start (Arias, 2016). On the other, the failed previous dialogues cracked the citizens' trust in the seriousness of the guerrillas suspecting that the dialogues in La Havana were used for rearming and taking a breath to carry on with the war (Gómez-Suárez, 2017; Hernández, 2019).

A second crucial pre-text was the negotiations, demobilizations and peace processes of previous Colombian governments, especially in the 1900's decade, and the movements for peace in the country. Hence, the negotiations and Peace Agreements supported on experiences already performed as regards demobilization, disarmament and reintegration (DDR) of armed movements such as guerrilla M-19 early in the nineties and a number of paramilitary groups in the period 2003-2006.⁷ Likewise, the resources for peacebuilding in the territories followed the work of several decades of numberless organizations and social and human rights leaders who had had successful experiences such as the zones of peace and communities of peace in Colombia and with transnational links (Hancock and Mitchell, 2007; Mouly and Hernández, 2019). The experience of the National Commission on Reparation and Reconciliation (CNRR), created from the Law of Justice and Peace (Law 975, in 2005), was key to devise the architecture of reconciliation as public policy in Colombia (Bueno, 2017).

⁷ According to figures of Agency for Reincorporation and Normalization (ARN) more than 73,000 people (approximately 65,000 men and 8,000 women) came out from armed groups outside the law between 2001 and 2018: Ex-AUC aprox. 35,000; Ex-FARC-EP individually demobilized aprox. 19,000; Ex-ELN aprox. 4,000; Ex FARC-EP after the Final agreement in 2016 aprox. 13,000 (ARN, 2019).

From the Group of Historic Memory of CNRR, in 2010 the Center of Historic Memory was born (CMH) under the direction of Gonzalo Sánchez. Reports, research and methodologies developed by CMH were a fundamental contribution to promote relevant information and research with high audiovisual and pedagogical contents, which served to increase awareness-becoming on the scope of the war in Colombia, as well as the movements of pacific resistance which have opposed resistance (CMH, 2013). The current pedagogies for reconciliation also nourish on these important advances in writing an imperfect peace history (Muñoz, 2006).

A final face is inter-textual relations, that is to say, the interdependencies of the Final Agreement with other peace agreements and institutional agreements forged in other places of the world.⁸ Reflections on the positive and negative of other agreements and the lessons on their implementation were considered directly by the parties in the design and setting into motion in peace talks.⁹ It is worth underscoring, for instance, the role of the facilitating countries, warrantors and supporters of the peace process to overcome crises and that offered decisive aspects of the agreements in their content, such as the consideration of the experiences of diverse sexual identities¹⁰ and the central position of victims and civil society in the text of the Final Agreement.

The con-text, pre-texts and inter-textual relations, though succinctly mentioned in previous paragraphs, give an account of the limits and the field in which the very text of the Final Agreement developed. In the drafting of the Agreement text, numberless people and institutions were present: the negotiating teams of FARC-EP guerillas, the negotiating team of the Colombian government, delegations of warrantor countries, international cooperation and external advisors (Hernández, 2019; Bouvier, 2016). These

8 Northern Ireland, El Salvador, Angola, South Africa, as well as Chad, Indonesia, Mali y and Sudan were explicitly considered and pondered by the negotiators regarding their lessons for the Colombian (Arias, 2016).

9 The ideas of including a commission of truth and reconciliation, for example, are partly born from the systematic study of counties in transition around the world. The monitoring of setting up the agreement by a Verification Commission supported by Kroc Institute for International Peace Studies of Notre Dame University also provides a comparative look with more than 35 peace agreements around the world.

10 The *gender mainstreaming* of the agreement, i.e., the transversalization of the look “produced” in the Agreement was one of the greatest accomplishments of the Colombian experience and, unfortunately, was also one of the points that most votes and popular support subtracted from them (Gómez-Suárez, 2017; Daşlı *et al.*, 2018; Bouvier, 2016).

various voices and representations seemed to understand the various phases and challenges to negotiate and draft the Agreement, to later submit it to the consideration of Colombian society by means of the plebiscite to begin to implement it. By the end of the negotiation stage in Havana, in February 2016, Sergio Jaramillo, leader of the group, described how PR proposals had been the central idea of the Colombian peace process.

For Jaramillo (2016: 14), the process was not understood “only as the movement of FARC toward civil life, but as the gradual elimination of the factors that feed the war for so long”. Then according to Jaramillo, the negotiation agenda contemplated that after signing the Agreement, it would be fundamental to create “platforms of relations that produce changes” (Jaramillo, 2016: 14).

The post-agreement phase would bridge the gaps produced between the communities in the territories during war, deconstruct distrust and make “each person [become] an actor, not a spectator, of peacebuilding” (Jaramillo, 2016: 15). From the standpoint of Jaramillo (2016: 16), in order to recreate the virtuous cycle of peace, it is necessary that institutions respond with changes in favor of peace, that the State roots in the territory¹¹ and that people participate in spaces for dialogue so that the energy of the territorial peace can flow.

Supported upon this tripartite structure, the institutional architecture or reconciliation would be one of the necessary supporting points (though not sufficient) to elicit our many reconciliations. In the Final Agreement, the architecture for reconciliation is considered with greater emphasis on the following sections:

2.2.4. Guarantees for reconciliation, coexistence, tolerance and no-stigmatization, especially due to political and social actions in the context of civility. This by means of the Creation of the National Council for Reconciliation and Coexistence.

3.4.7.4.4. Execution of the Program for Reconciliation and Prevention of Stigmatization with the participation of territorial entities.

11 It is important to retake the considerations of researcher Luis Peña (2019), who writes that the urban and elitist origin of the government’s negotiators marked the perspective that peace and territorial reconciliation need to “fill the territory” with institutions, which contradicts the idea that the senti-thinking territorial peace referred to at the beginning (Escobar, 2014). There must be a balance between State presence and the creation of power empowered by peace, which implies that post-agreement peace must be undertaken by the effected communities in the spatial (Peña, 2019) and imaginative recreation (Lederach, 2016) of its own peaces, where arts and citizen participation –not the state institutions– are the protagonists.

5.1. Integral System of Truth, Justice, Reparation and No-repetition [SIVJRR]. Recognition of the victims, recognition and definition of responsibilities, and in general, recognition from the entire society of the need to use this opportunity to build a better future on the basis of social justice, respect and tolerance (ARN, 2019).

In this line, it is worth underscoring that in the Final Agreement, SIJVR¹² became the axis of transitional justice as the pillar of truth, the reconstruction of historic memory and justice “in reconciliation perspective” (Bueno, 2017: 18, emphasis added). This is to say, not only does SIVJRR point at addressing the historic, judicial, ethical and humanitarian truths, but also to rebuild the stories from the affected communities and raise public awareness of the horrors of war (Bueno, 2017: 19).

These qualities become tangible by enquiring on the composition, objectives and characteristics of SIVJRR in the key of reconciliation. SIVJRR comprises judicial and extrajudicial mechanisms with three fundamental organs: 1) the Commission on Ascertaining the Truth (CEV) as an impartial, independent, transitory and extrajudicial mechanism; 2) the Special Unit for the Search of People Considered Missing (UBPD), with humanitarian and extrajudicial character; and, 3) Special Jurisdiction for Peace (JEP), with judicial functions to investigate, judge and publish crimes committed in the context and because of the armed conflict (Goebertus, 2016).¹³

The goals also differ and complement one another. CEV intends to

listen to victims, responsible and witness of the armed conflict from every sector, regions and social conditions in the country to gather a wide and comprehensive account of the facts and contexts that explain 50-year war (CEV, 2019a).

UBPD:

has as an objective to direct, coordinate and contribute to the implementation of humanitarian actions to search and locate people considered missing in the context and because of the armed conflict who are alive and, in the case of deceases, if possible, recover, identify and decorous deliverance of the bodies (UBPD, 2019a).

12 The integrality of the system has been set into motion a number of times since the approval of the Final Agreement by the Congress in 2016. To a large extent, the context of post-truth experienced along the negotiations did not cease, but increased after the election of president Iván Duque in June 2018 and the Final Agreement was developed with great legislative difficulties in the Congress of the Republic (Echavarría *et al.*, 2019).

13 Adding to these three organs, SIVJRR also considers measures of comprehensive reparation for peacebuilding and the guarantees of no-repetition.

Finally, JEP:

has the function of administrating transactional justice and acknowledging crimes committed in the context of the armed conflict which had been committed before December 1st, 2016 [...] to serve the rights of the victims of justice, offer them truth and contribute to reparation (JEP, 2019).

The temporal coordinates also make that the comprehensive system, for even if CEV has a three-year validity, JEP and UBPD will be in force for 20 years.

It is worth underscoring that SIVJRR is crossed by a conceptual and methodological concern about the pedagogies needed for reconciliation.¹⁴ Owing to space and scope constrictions, this article focuses on CEV, more so because its mission and especially the deliverance of the final report in 2021 makes the work of PR in its favor necessary and urgent.

In CEV (2019b: 23) methodology, pedagogy is described as the work on attitudes and values to strengthen capabilities for pacific coexistence. CEV follows a pedagogical work that heads to prioritize networks of children, youths, women and elderly people, and members of education institutions.

By means of art and cultural expressions, vital experiences will activate with a view to touching emotions, generating collective confidence, compassion for the victims' pain, responsibility between generations, ethnicities, genders, spiritualities, sectors and political perspectives, and indignation in the face of the destruction of nature that allow mutual recognition and the possibility to collectively walk and be creative in nonviolent dynamics and logics of society (CEV, 2019b: 23).

Arts and culture, additionally, are one of the dimensions prioritized by CEV as regards its fulfillment. For example, not only is it sought to "identify the cultural contexts in which conflicts unfold" (CEV, 2019b: 31), but also to call to "produce, activate and make visible artistic expressions related to the mission and mandates of the Commission" (CEV, 2019b: 32), participate in artistic and cultural events with contents propitious to the installation of the objectives and mission of CEV, and forge strategic alliances to "produce, disseminate, communicate and become aware of the aspects of culture that must be transformed or potentialized" (CEV, 2019b: 32).

14 For example, UBPD (2019b) promotes "pedagogy for the search", which intends "to facilitate the comprehension of the mechanism, forms of access, and the active participation of victims, organizations and general society in the processes of humanitarian and extrajudicial search [...] as well as promote the recognition and solidarity of society in the search for those missing in the context and because of the armed conflict in Colombia". These pedagogies for search aim at grasping the meaning of the search itself, also elicit circles of creative know-hows, dialogues that produce sensibility and solidarity.

This way, pedagogy and arts are joined from the start in SIGVRR and in this particular case, in CEV. For the commissioner Lucía González (cited in CEV, 2019c), as war transformed and destroyed culture, an institutional effort must be made to make visible, recognize and valorize:

The aesthetic expressions in restorative processes of victims and the pool of social learnings of the victims who created songs, fabrics, murals, performances, dances, plays and poems to narrate themselves and express their hopes. “Art is a restoring process. It is a deep expression of the cultures and a way to rebuild the social being in their territory” (CEV, 2019c).

CEV has encouraged, accompanied and made visible large artistic expressions such as the work *Fragmentos* by Doris Salcedo (Museo Nacional de Colombia, 2019), an counter-monument made of cast iron from the weapons surrendered by FARC-EP.

For the experience of a victim may be understood in its entire graveness, it must be expressed, narrated and shared. Owing to this *Fragmentos* is a place of memory that has as a mission to produce and display, for as long as the conflict lasted, various works of art that re-elaborate the memory of war. Each year, an artist will be invited to display their view and interpretation of our recent past. There will not be a single, but many changing, polyphonic a live counter-monuments. *Fragmentos* calls for a permanent memory in state of transformation (Salcedo, 2018).

Owing to this, beyond the symbolical reparation, arts in post-agreement are not only the expression of violence and reconciliation desire, but operate as fundamental mechanisms to serve the victims’ rights and articulate the perspectives of the aggressors in the fabric of violences, peaces and reconciliations in Colombia (Sierra, 2019). This way, the aesthetics of pedagogies for reconciliations and arts in relation to transactional justice in post-agreement contexts begin to spin together, which are as varied as the very standpoints and experiences of wars and peaces may be.

Weaving voices, histories and images of reconciliation

It is “Recognize, dialogue and humanize”, according to Gonzalo Sánchez (2019), the pedagogical contribution that multiple artistic expressions communicate and evoke around the reconciliation processes in Colombia. Supported on this standpoint, in this section the results of the qualitative research on artistic practices for reconciliation in Colombia are reported. This sample does not intend to be representative, but displaying the myriad

of artistic practices across the length and breadth of the Territory in terms of geographies, forms of expression, participants' perspectives and research techniques. The three illustrative examples were selected on the basis of territorial peaces, anchored on their cultural contexts and under the following criteria.

1. They are located in three different regions in Colombia (Bogota, Medellin and Barrancabermeja), changing geographies, diverse ethnic compositions.
2. In three different formats (professional photography, documental filmmaking and handicrafts).
3. Artistic practices produced by professionals and non-professionals.
4. Produced by men and women.
5. Researched by the author by means of three different instruments (autoethnography, semi-structured interview and focus group).
6. The research instruments provide a three-sided outlook: that of the visitor or attendee (the one that "consumes") and the perspective of the female artistic creators of documental filmmaking and artisans (those who "produce").

In spite of their heterogeneity, these artistic practices have as a common characteristic they fail to communicate, soften and articulate "the experiences of war as a diversity of shared pains" (Sánchez, 2019) and the many possibilities for reconciliation in the plurality of territorial peaces.

The first section refers to an auto-ethnographic of the photographic exposition, *El Testigo*, by Jesús Abad Colorado, in Claustro de San Agustín (Bogota, February 2019). The second is born after the semi-structured interview with documentary filmmaker Daniela Abad Lombana on the relation between arts and reconciliation, peaces and violences (Medellin, March 2019). The third narrative is the product of a focus group in conjunction with *Más Arte Más Paz* by Magdalena Medio (Barrancabermeja, March 2019). More than an account of these experiences, the text focuses on the second research question guidance noted at the beginning of this article: what sort of reconciliations are being forged from arts?

Jesús Abad Colorado: El Testigo

Probably, the most famous Colombian war photographer, Jesús Abad Colorado, aka "Chucho", has covered how the conflict has vulnerated communities over the entire territory for a number of decades (1992-

2018). His images were condensed in the pages of newspapers such as *El Colombiano*, always showing human expression of deep pain.

With his graphic journalism, not only does Chuchó show the experiences of the horrors of war, but also how necessary and heartfelt reconciliation is.

More than 500 photographs are comprised in *El Testigo*, each of them added the descriptions of specific stories on when and where the photographs were taken and, on their protagonists (Universidad Nacional de Colombia, 2019). *El Testigo* is displayed in Claustro de San Agustín, a place in the middle of the decisions of the central political power, because of its proximity to the presidential palace –House of Nariño–, the Congress and Ministry of Finance. In addition to the images, the exhibition is accompanied by graphs and maps that provide figures and contextualizations for the visitors (Universidad Nacional de Colombia, 2019). Excerpts of poetry by Maya Angelou, words of reflection by the artist and by curator María Belén Sáez de Ibarra are written on the walls, interspersed with the photographs.

More than 70 thousand people visited the exhibition, from October 20th to the end of December 2018; consequentially, the exhibition was extended up to February 2019 (*Semana*, 2019). By virtue of this extension, a visit was made in February 2019, of which some autoethnographic sections are shared as a brief qualitative sample of the experience as a visitor.

I reach the *El Testigo* a Thursday morning. The sun shines in the Capital, as it is only possible at 2,600 meters in the Tropic, warmly, but without burning.

After a meeting in the first floor in the Claustro, in the offices of CAPAZ with Martin and Luis, my travel companions in this academic adventure, go for a moment to the first floor.

We have seen the visit, but I still feel the goosebumps; I know what waits for me: Chuchó's photographs, which I carry in my memory as tattoos.

That boy buttoning a dead man's shirt on a stretcher, with a striped shirt, the boy with an expression of love and solemnity that can only make me think that the man is his father. His father, who possibly died in a violent, unjust and cruel act.

I can't recall where this photograph was taken, I only know that when I think of Jesús Abad Colorado, this image comes to mind accompanied with the goosebumps.

I try to hold myself together: "he is not your father", I told myself, trying to console myself, but I know is "someone" as important as my father was for me, someone for whom the boy buttoning the shirt softened and shook.

We start to walk the exhibition and there it is: the photograph of the boy. Taken in San Carlos (Antioquia), after the murder of the father by the paramilitary in 1988.

Images fraught with pain.

I see a dog that seems to be sleeping on a platform and its back reads the initials AUC.
How much suffering we inflict on one another and the nature!

Amidst the exhibition, there are some three trunks, which come from the ground as *Hundertwasser* architecture: non-leveled surfaces, which give an account of life and its indomitability.

Timid tears stop flowing over my cheeks and turn into a cry.

I go out to the corridor –my grandfather would call it a farmhouse, as it a colonial building with a central open-air patio.

How hard my body aches (Echavarría, unpublished).

Daniela Abad Lombana: Historias de dos abuelos

Carta a una sombra [Letter to a shadow] (2015) and *The Smiling Lombana* (2018) are documental feature films that the young filmmaker, Daniela Abad Lombana has written produced and directed with great success. Letter to a shadow is a film of the book written by her father, Héctor Abad Faciolince, *El olvido que seremos* [Oblivion] (Abad, 2006), on her grandparent from her parent's side Héctor Abad Gómez, medic defender of Human Rights assassinated in 1987. The second documentary deals with her maternal grandfather, Tito Lombana, an artist who looked for fortune in Europe and worked pleasing the drug lords' tastes, to later be apprehended and condemned to prison in the United States.

The public story of Héctor Abad and his death, the shame and silence around Tito Lombana seemed to represent two antagonistic figures of war and peace, however Daniela problematizes this simple duality and invites to a reflection that speaks of making imperfect peaces and weave many reconciliations by means of art.

Early in March 2019, Daniella reaches Colegiatura Colombiana en Medellín to make an interview, whose main topic approaches the relations between art, violence and peace, in the sense that art can legitimize certain sorts of violences and also the way it may sharpen the gaze to foster peacebuilding. The interview starts with two fundamental questions Who is Daniela? And, how do arts contribute to reconciliation? But, Daniela does not answer directly, but goes beyond and proposes something different.

For me the bet films work [...] as an echo, like after a week you realize you are still thinking of what you saw [...] what I would expect when I make films is to generate

thoughts in this way [...] that people keep thinking about it for some days [...]. I think that is accomplished [...] through emotion [...]. I don't believe art [...] works firstly by reason and then, emotion, but such reasoning first passes through emotion and then to reason and thinking (interview with Daniela Abad, in 2019).

Daniela intends that in her productions the spectator connects with the story she is narrating, "that they move, cry, laugh, are attentive, do not lose their attention" (Abad, 2019).

Art maybe leaves more than a sensation [...] art is not in charge -I believe- of producing data, but sensations so that if you want, go and find out, but I don't believe documentaries have to be... like Wikipedia [...] By means of documentaries, I'm going to get excited, and by means of emotion, I'm going to get certain information. But the main goal of the documentary is to report, not to thrill (Abad, 2019).

Owing to this, Abad (2019) argues, art is not something "good" in itself, but filmmakers (and artists in general) intend that spectators become sensitized as regards certain sentiments and thoughts, for art precisely tries to call attention to the scars left by violence. Moreover, artistic interventions at times and spaces for peacebuilding invite to dialogue on processes in which society ends up closely linked such as drug dealing (Abad, 2019). Either by means of the creation of new territorial spaces for memory, for instance, Casa Museo de la Memoria (CMC), in Medellín (Echavarría, 2015), such as the sacralization of terror with no reconstruction –for example, the statue *El Pájaro*, by Fernando Botero, in Plaza San Antonio in Medellín, which was bombarded by FARC-EP in 1995 and was never restored–, "the most important is there is a conversation" (Abad, 2019), a dialogue on the violence suffered and prolonged (intentionally or due to inaction) by one another.

In the end of the interview, Daniela Abad expresses something that directly remits to sentiments for many peaces and reconciliations (Martínez Guzmán, 2005: 140-142): "For me, the best is to manage to move someone" (Abad, 2019). Indubitably, her documentaries are deeply moving, they showcase the love for her family and underscoring the hope and reconciliation that lie in the very human fragility.

Más Arte Más Paz: handicraft for reconciliation

The third artistic instance of the many reconciliations weaved in Colombia develops in Barrancabermeja, in Magdalena Medio, one of the regions with the highest index of violence in the history of the armed conflict in Colombia, with its height between 1998 and 2002, period over which the territory and its inhabitants were fought over by guerillas and the paramilitary (CNNH,

2013: 170). But Magdalena Medio has also been a region characterized by the pacifist empowering, being Programa de Desarrollo y Paz del Magdalena Medio, PDPMM [Program for Development and Peace in Magdalena Medio], one of the most successful experiences of community organization and nonviolent resistance in Colombia.

The beauty of the territory is exuberant, temperature and moisture are high. Under mango trees and drinking coconut water, on March 2019, the author had the chance to facilitate a conversation with a focus group with women from the association Más Arte Más Paz. The association was born in 2018 supported by Agencia para la Reincorporación y la Normalización, ARN [Agency for Reincorporation and Normalization],¹⁵ which groups victims of the armed conflict and the affected community, and also female former combatants, who have deposited the weapons of illegal groups and are reintegrating or reincorporating.

The focus group was composed of 10 members of the associations, who were asked to tell the background of their joint work. They told that Más Arte Más Paz was born as a productive initiative by the former combatants. They had already met in seminars and workshops part of the Model for Community Reintegration, MRC that ARN carries out supported by International Organization for Migration (OIM).

Over these meetings, the ex-combatants decided to keep their identities and not to reveal the groups they had belonged to and where they had been active over the war. This decision was because they knew that the mixed composition of the group, reinserted and reincorporated, implied they had been enemies during the armed conflict. They wanted to hold their sessions to approach, reconcile and forgiveness, as well as heal their personal wound, as a community, with their new partners and even friends. This did not mean to hide.

Or silence the pain, but to tell about it, but in a way for proper names to be shared later, for in their opinion, they were not fundamental for the process.

After a number of months, women realized that in most of their sessions they sat to knit, some taught others to sew, that they were engaged in moving their hands and knitting collectively. "It was like a meditation", one of them said. Artesanías de Colombia provided them with technical support via its Laboratory of Design and Innovation, and by artisans of the region and

¹⁵ At present, ARN accompanies the reintegration processes of approximately 6,000 former combatants into civilian life and reincorporation of more than 13,000 former combatants from FARC-EP after the signing of the Final Agreement (ARN, 2019).

using their knowledge many of them had, then they wanted to found their own artisan associations.

However, before officially founding it, they felt they had to disclose their actual identities. This way, the women who heard the others knew who they were in the war and who they are “in civil life” (as they say) might consciously and informedly decide to belong to the association. The disclosing process was intense and deep, as it is told. Various weeks took the meetings, to ask for and to forgive, rituals and chants, and some farewells by those who did not feel in conditions to carry on. Those who remained and even others demobilized due to the process with Autodefensas Unidas de Colombia (AUC) in 2006 founded *Más Arte, Más Paz* in December 2018.

As they begin their work, they feel optimistic, since they already have products popularly sold in a number of fairs; stools, baskets and backpacks, and even they have published a calendar with photographs of the crafts. In the calendar it is read: “In Barrancabermeja, handicrafts have a soul. Each of them carries our essence, our dreams and our hope to build a better future for everyone” (*Más Arte, Más Paz*, 2019). They have also purchased a small stand in the airport of Barrancabermeja. There they have the possibility to sell their products and be known, telling this story of artisans’ hands, woven forgiveness and reconstructions of lives. Is this reconciliation for them? Do they feel reconciled? How has art helped them over this process? These are some answers from the focus group.

My reconciliation was not only with those reinserted, but with all the group [...] we managed to reconcile by means of love and I felt that a burden left my life [...] I’m able to look at other people in another way (woman 1).

Reconciliation started with myself [...] the Guerrilla killed all my family and I enrolled in autodefensas thinking of “making justice” [...] it was like a machine [...] hatred and resentment surface [...] [the reconciliation was for me] The love of God that reaches one’s heart and changes life in another way [...] Here, we all lost.

God forgives everything. I also want to be forgiven (woman 2).

We understood that they have problems and suffering. They were isolated. We tried to unite them by means of art. [...] [Reconciliation for me was] reconcile with them (woman 3).

For me, art is like honey. Honey on a plate, attractive, that I enjoy to satiation. This is the embroidering, the needle and beads [showing the calendar, she reads] “In Barrancabermeja handicrafts have a soul”. A soul with the tranquility of the spirit (woman 4).

I'm also a woman in process of reintegration process and I want to ask the community for forgiveness. Forgiveness though the fabric. One weaves and gets into this. [By] Weaving one fills with pride (woman 5).

Change starts from the inside, not the other way. [Intones a song and sings] "There is nothing perfect, love, love is imperfect [...] the perfect is nonhuman" (woman 6).

The relationship with Philosophy for Peacemaking becomes evident: if human beings are imperfect, not only our peace will be imperfect and unfinished, but also our reconciliations.

Conclusions

This article started with an invitation to into two fundamental questions: how can reconciliation processes nourish PR theories in order not to forget the call to research "at the service of humanity" (Martínez Guzmán, 2001)? and, what sort of reconciliations are being forged from arts in Colombia?

Hand in hand with the teachings by Martínez Guzmán, a broad road of ideas, experiences and reflections generously offered by other researchers for peace; they speak of the importance of bearing the plurality of human beings and embrace fragility not as a weakness to overcome, but as the very source of relational peaces. Facing conflicts and violences from vulnerability implies as well that with courage political and institutional changes can be woven, as it was the case of the Final Agreement, plus personal changes and relationships, as the researched artistic expressions display.

Watching the images of the directly affected people and communities, learning from their life stories by means of the cinema and listen to their voices while sharing coconut water are experiences that nourish from fertile ground that is the Final Agreement, but which have to be cultivated in the best meaning that Martínez Guzmán gave the text, so that these many peaces and reconciliations still have room to breathe and nutrients to continue growing. Not intending it to be a prescriptive and complete model, but as an elicit and imperfect path:

1. If violence and conflicts separate and create communication voids between the arts, pedagogy for reconciliation points at draw them near, to allow listening one another.
2. If violence and conflicts have prevented the articulation of intentions and the old adversaries are not recognized, pedagogy for reconciliation invites to congruently and nonviolently communicate the capability of listen in an empathic manner and communicate in an authentic one.

3. If violence and conflicts entangle relationships and make it difficult to notice alternative ways to relate, pedagogy for reconciliation helps us recognize ourselves as potential facilitators of proper problems, to empower and appreciate that human beings are capable of jointly identifying new courses of action.
4. These reencounters, or callings to recall the common humanity cannot be limited to engage the old parts in conflicts via reason nor purely analytically. The aesthetics of personal, collective and institutional transformation need metaphoric, aural and cyclical social change, therefore affective pedagogies and didactics that point at integrally moving.
5. Even though, the institutional frame of reconciliation does not directly allude to pedagogy, over the development of SIVJNRN institutions, the need to design and setting up pedagogies of peace and reconciliation becomes explicit. This is a niche of great relevance for the building of stable and long-lasting peace.
6. Arts are a central element in reconciliations, for the language and metaphorical trade of the artists are, at once, the language and metaphorical trade of the actors and actresses of the building of many peaces and reconciliations. Arts allow the artists to keep in touch with their pulse of interior life and when they share them, they allow others to partake of their internal processes and belonging to the communities that not only have experienced them, but are also collectively cured. Their healing inspires and transforms the community as well.

The change observed, listened and palpated in the artistic practices mentioned has to be amplified, as weaves. In Colombia, there is an invaluable opportunity for the Final Agreement to translate as many reconciliations, for in spite of being imperfect such as the singing of love, they are the air that keeps souls alive. From the daily and artistic endeavor, everyone can build peace.

References

- Abad, Daniela (2019), Interview with Josefina Echavarría, in Medellín, Colombia, March 5th 2019.
- Abad, Héctor (2006), *El olvido que seremos*, Colombia: Planeta.
- Acuerdo Final (2016), *Acuerdo final para la terminación del conflicto y la construcción de una paz estable y duradera*, Colombia: Oficina del Alto Comisionado para la Paz. Available at: <http://www.altocomisionadoparalapaz.gov.co/procesos-y-conversaciones/Documentos%20compartidos/24-11-2016NuevoAcuerdoFinal.pdf> [July 4th, 2019].

- Arias, Gerson (2016), "Contexto Histórico: Lecciones Aprendidas para la Paz", in *Diplomado Paz a la Acción*, Colombia: Escuela Superior de Administración Pública.
- ARN [Agencia para la Reincorporación y la Normalización] (2019), "ARN Bajo Magdalena Medio", in *Foro Construcción de Paz y Reconciliación*, Colombia: Universidad Cooperativa de Colombia.
- Bouvier, Virginia (2014), "Innovative Approaches in the Colombian Peace Process", in *Mediation Perspectives*, Switzerland: Center for Security Studies.
- Bouvier, Virginia (2016), *El Género y el Papel de las Mujeres en el Proceso de Paz de Colombia*, United States: ONU Mujeres.
- Bueno, María Angélica (2017), "Políticas públicas de reconciliación: Un reto posible en la construcción y la sostenibilidad de la paz en Colombia", in *Análisis Político*, no. 90, Colombia: Universidad Nacional de Colombia.
- Cairo, Heriberto *et al.* (2018), "'Territorial Peace': The Emergence of a Concept in Colombia's Peace Negotiations", in *Geopolitics*, vol. 23, no. 2, England: Taylor and Francis. DOI: 10.1080/14650045.2018.1425110. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1080/14650045.2018.1425110> [July 4th, 2019].
- Carta a una sombra* (2015), Documentary, directors: Daniela Abad and Miguel Salazar, Colombia: Producciones La Esperanza y Caracol Televisión.
- CEV [Comisión de la Verdad] (2019a), *21 claves para conocer a la Comisión de la Verdad*, Colombia: Comisión de la Verdad. Available at: <https://comisiondelaverdad.co/participe/preguntas-frecuentes> [July 4th, 2019].
- CEV [Comisión de la Verdad] (2019b), *Lineamientos Metodológicos Escuchar, Reconocer, y Comprender Para Transformar*, Colombia: Comisión de la Verdad. Available at: <https://comisiondelaverdad.co/images/zoo/publicaciones/archivos/comision-verdad-lineamientos-metodologicos-2019-01-18.pdf> [July 4th, 2019].
- CEV [Comisión de la Verdad] (2019c), *Cuatro preguntas clave para entender el papel del arte y la cultura en la comprensión del conflicto*, Colombia: Comisión de la Verdad. Available at: <https://comisiondelaverdad.co/actualidad/noticias/cuatro-preguntas-clave-para-entender-el-papel-del-arte-y-la-cultura-en-la-comprension-del-conflicto-armado> [July 4th, 2019].
- CNMH [Centro Nacional de Memoria Histórica] (2013), *¡Basta ya! Colombia: Memorias de guerra y dignidad*, Colombia: Centro Nacional de Memoria Histórica.
- Comins, Irene (2015), "De víctimas a sobrevivientes: la fuerza poética y resiliente del cuidar", in *Convergencia Revista de Ciencias Sociales*, no. 67, Mexico: Universidad Autónoma del Estado de México. DOI: 10.29101/crcs.v0i67.2181. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.29101/crcs.v0i67.2181> [July 4th, 2019].
- Cremin, Hilary and Archer, Tim (2018), "Transrational Education: Exploring Possibilities for Learning About Peace, Harmony, Justice and Truth in the Twenty First Century", in Echavarría, Josefina *et al.* [eds.], *Transrational Resonances: Echoes to the Many Peaces*, Inglaterra: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Daşlı, Güneş *et al.* (2018), *Peace and Gender: The Colombian Peace Process*, Turkey: Research Center for Peace, Democracy and Alternative Politics.
- Defensoría del Pueblo (2019), *Homicidios de Líderes Sociales y Defensores de Derechos Humanos*, Colombia: Defensoría del Pueblo. Available at: <http://www.defensoria.gov.co/es/public/contenido/7399/Homicidios-de-l%C3%ADderes-sociales-y-defensores-de-DDHH.htm> [July 4th, 2019].

- Dietrich, Wolfgang (2012), *Interpretations of Peace in History and Culture*, England: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Dietrich, Wolfgang (2013), *Elicitive Conflict Transformation and the Transnational Turn in Peace Politics*, England: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Dietrich, Wolfgang (2017), *Elicitive Conflict Mapping*, England: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Du Toit, Faine (2018), *When Political Transitions Work: Reconciliation as Interdependence*, United States: Oxford University Press.
- Echavarría, Josefina (2010), *In/Security in Colombia: Writing Political Identities in the Democratic Security Policy*, England: Manchester University Press.
- Echavarría, Josefina (2015), "Die Kunst des Social Healing in Kolumbien", in *Polylog: Zeitschrift für interkulturelles Philosophieren*, no. 34, Vienna: Wiener Gesellschaft für Interkulturelle Philosophie.
- Echavarría, Josefina (unpublished), *Diario de Investigación*.
- Echavarría, Josefina et al. (2019), *Wahlen und Weichenstellungen in Lateinamerika 2018: Eine länderspezifische Analyse*, Austria: University of Vienna and Austrian Institute for Latin America.
- Enslin, Penny and Ramírez-Hurtado, Carmen (2013), "Artistic Education and the Possibilities for Citizenship Education", in *Citizenship, Social and Economics Education*, vol. 12, no. 2, England: Sage.
- Escobar, Arturo (2014), *Sentipensar con la tierra: nuevas lecturas sobre desarrollo, territorio y diferencia*, Colombia: Ediciones Universidad Autónoma Latinoamericana (UNAULA).
- Forastelli, Fabricio (2015), "Filosofía para hacer las paces: un esbozo biográfico-intelectual de Vicent Martínez Guzmán", in *Revista Interdisciplinar de Direitos Humanos*, no. 4, Brazil: Observatório de Educação em Direitos Humanos.
- Fundación Pares (2018), *Cómo va la paz: La reestructuración unilateral del Acuerdo de Paz*, Colombia: Fundación Pares. Available at: <https://pares.com.co/2018/11/27/como-va-la-paz-la-reestructuracion-unilateral-del-acuerdo-de-paz/> [July 4th, 2019].
- Goebertus, Juanita (2016), "Víctimas", in *Diplomado Paz a la Acción*, Colombia: Escuela Superior de Administración Pública.
- Gomez-Suárez, Andrei (2017), "Peace Process Pedagogy: lessons from the no-vote victory in the Colombian peace referendum", in *Comparative Education*, vol. 53, no. 3. DOI: 10.1080/03050068.2017.1334425. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1080/03050068.2017.1334425> [July 4th, 2019].
- Hancock, Landon and Mitchell, Christopher [eds.] (2007), *Zones of Peace*, United States: Kumarian Press.
- Hernández, Esperanza (2019), *Del limbo al acuerdo final de paz. El proceso de paz entre el Gobierno Santos y las Farc-EP*, Colombia: Universidad Autónoma de Bucaramanga.
- Hernández, Esperanza [ed.] (2018), *Educación para la Paz y Procesos de Paz*, Colombia: Universidad de la Salle.
- Jaramillo, Sergio (2016), "Prólogo: La Imaginación para la Paz", in Lederach, John Paul, *La Imaginación Moral*, Colombia: Semana Libros.
- JEP [Jurisdicción Especial para la Paz] (2019), "Jurisdicción Especial para la Paz". Available at: <https://www.jep.gov.co/Paginas/JEP/Jurisdiccion-Especial-para-la-Paz.aspx> [July 4th, 2019].
- Jiménez Robles, Juan Manuel (2016), "On Forgiveness and Reconciliation in post-conflict societies: A Philosophical Perspective", in *Revista Interdisciplinar de Direitos Humanos*, vol. 4, no. 2, Brazil: Observatório de Educação em Direitos Humanos.

- Koppensteiner, Norbert (2018), "Transnational methods of Peace Research: The Researcher as (Re)source", in Echavarría, Josefina *et al.* [eds.], *Transrational Resonances: Echoes to the Many Peaces*, England: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Kroc Institute (2018), *Second Kroc Institute Report Shows Steady Progress of Peace Accord Implementation in Colombia*, Colombia: Kroc Institute for International Peace Studies. Available at: <https://kroc.nd.edu/news-events/news/second-kroc-institute-report-shows-steady-progress-of-peace-acord-implementation-in-colombia/> [July 4th, 2019].
- Lederach, John Paul (1995), *Preparing for Peace: Conflict Transformation Across Cultures*, United States: Syracuse University Press.
- Lederach, John Paul (2016), *La Imaginación Moral: El arte y el Alma de la Construcción de la Paz*, Colombia: Semana Libros.
- Lederach, John Paul and Lederach, Angela Jill (2014), *Cuando la sangre y los huesos claman: Travesías por el paisaje sonoro de la curación y la reconciliación*, Basque Country: Asociación de Investigación por la Paz Gernika Gogoratuz.
- Leiner, Martin and Flämig, Susan (2012), "Reconciliation in the Middle of Dispute", in Leiner, Martin and Flämig, Susan [eds.], *Latin America between Conflict and Reconciliation*, Germany: Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht.
- Martínez Guzmán, Vicent (2001), *Filosofía para hacer las paces*, Spain: Icaria.
- Martínez Guzmán, Vicent (2005), *Podemos Hacer las Paces. Reflexiones éticas tras el 11-S y el 11-M*, Spain: Desclée de Brouwer.
- Martínez Guzmán, Vicent *et al.* (2009), "La nueva agenda de la filosofía para el siglo XXI: los estudios para la paz", in *Convergencia, Revista de Ciencias Sociales*, special Anniversary Issue IA, México: Universidad Autónoma del Estado de México.
- Más Arte Más Paz (2019), "Calendario 2019", Colombia: Más Arte Más Paz.
- Mouly, Cecile and Hernández, Esperanza [eds.] (2019), *Civil Resistance and Violent Conflict in Latin America. Mobilizing for Rights*, England: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Muñoz, Francisco (2006), "La Paz Imperfecta en un Universo en Conflicto", in Dietrich, Wolfgang *et al.* [comps.], *Schlüsseltexthe der Friedensforschung/ Key Texts of Peace Studies/ Textos Claves de la Investigación para la Paz*, Austria: Lit.
- Murphy, Jenny (2018), "Elephant Watering (W)hole: Transrational Learning Spaces", in Echavarría, Josefina *et al.* [eds.], *Transrational Resonances: Echoes to the Many Peaces*, England: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Museo Nacional de Colombia (2019), *Fragmentos: Espacio de Arte y Memoria*, Colombia: Museo Nacional de Colombia. Available at: <http://www.museonacional.gov.co/micrositios1/Fragmentos/index.html#section-practicing-areas> [July 4th, 2019].
- Paffenholz, Thania (2015), "Unpacking the local turn in peacebuilding: a critical assessment towards an agenda for future research", in *Third World Quarterly*, vol. 36, no. 5, England: Taylor and Francis. DOI: 10.1080/01436597.2015.1029908 Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1080/01436597.2015.1029908> [4 de julio de 2019].
- Paris-Albert, Sonia (2017), "Filosofía para hacer las paces con niñas y niños. Un estímulo para la creatividad", in *Convergencia Revista de Ciencias Sociales*, no. 75, Mexico: Universidad Autónoma del Estado de México.
- Peace Insight (2017), *Understanding the implementation of the Colombian peace agreement: the Kroc Institute Report*, England: Peace Direct.

- Peña, Luis (2019), "Paz Territorial: Conectando Imaginación Moral e Imaginación Geográfica", in *Working Papers CAPAZ*, no. 5, Colombia: CAPAZ Instituto Colombo-Alemán para la Paz.
- Rettberg, Angelika and Ugarriza, Juan (2016), "Reconciliation: A comprehensive framework for empirical analysis", in *Security Dialogue*, vol. 6, no. 47. DOI: 10.1177/0967010616671858. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1177%2F0967010616671858> [July 4th, 2019].
- Salcedo, Doris (2018), "Una Polifonía de Voces", in *Revista Arcadia*, Colombia: Publicaciones Semana.
- Sánchez, Gonzalo (2019), "La guerra en tres actos", in *Semana Online*. Available at: <https://www.semana.com/opinion/articulo/la-guerra-en-tres-actos-columna-de-gonzalo-sanchez/619401#> [July 4th, 2019].
- Semana* (2019), "Jesús Abad Colorado inaugura 'El testigo', su exposición más ambiciosa", in *Semana Online*. Available at: <https://www.semana.com/cultura/articulo/jesus-abad-colorado-inaugura-su-exposicion-el-testigo-en-el-museo-claustro-de-san-agustin/587578> [July 4th, 2019].
- Sierra, Yolanda (2019), "Yolanda Sierra: "El arte y la cultura contribuyen a la justicia restaurativa", in *El Espectador*, Colombia. Available at: <https://www.elespectador.com/colombia2020/justicia/jep/yolanda-sierra-el-arte-y-la-cultura-contribuyen-la-justicia-restaurativa-articulo-857844> [July 4th, 2019].
- The Smiling Lombana* (2018), Documental, directora Daniela Abad, Colombia: Producciones La Esperanza.
- UBPD [Unidad de Búsqueda de Personas Dadas por Desaparecidas] (2019a), "Acerca de la UBPD". Available at: <https://www.ubpdbusquedadesaparecidos.co/acerca-de-la-busqueda/> [July 4th, 2019].
- UBPD [Unidad de Búsqueda de Personas Dadas por Desaparecidas] (2019b), "Pedagogía". Available at: <https://www.ubpdbusquedadesaparecidos.co/pedagogia/> [July 4th, 2019].
- Universidad Nacional de Colombia (2019), "El Testigo: memorias del conflicto armado colombiano en el lente y la voz de Jesús Abad Colorado". Available at: <http://patrimoniocultural.bogota.unal.edu.co/eventos/article/el-testigo-memorias-del-conflicto-armado-colombiano-en-el-lente-y-la-voz-de-jesus-abad-colorado.html> [July 4th, 2019].

Josefina Echavarría Álvarez. Doctor in Peace, Conflicts and Democracy from Universitat Jaume I de Castellón, Spain. Co-Director of Centro de Investigación de Paz y Conflictos, InnPeace of the University of Innsbruck, Austria. Visiting professor in Kroc Institute for international peace Studies, University of Notre Dame, United States. Research lines: reconciliation, education and Peacebuilding; subjectivity, migration and (in)security, elicited analysis and mapping of conflicts; gender and peace. Recent publications: Echavarría Álvarez, Josefina and Koppensteiner, Norbert (2019), *Mediation und Elizitive Konflikttransformation*, Germany: Verlag Österreich; Echavarría Álvarez, Josefina and Cremin, Hilary (2019), “Education for territorial peace in Colombia: What role for transnational peace?”, in *Journal of Peace Education*, England: Taylor & Francis; Echavarría Álvarez, Josefina and Rojas, Erika Julieta (2018), “Sexualidad y reconocimiento como apuestas a la transformación de la securitización en El Salvador: una reflexión transnacional”, in *Organicom*, vol. 15, no. 28, Brazil: Universidade de São Paulo/ Gestcorp.